# Report: Migrants, ID and Access in Chile

CCCCCCCCCCCC

REPARTICA SIG

This research was carried out by Fundación Datos Protegidos with the support of Privacy International. Santiago, 2022.



## **\_ <<<<**

#### **Report: Migrants, ID and Access**

This research was carried out by **Fundación Datos Protegidos** with the support of **Privacy International**.

**DATOS PROTEGIDOS** is a non-profit organization. Founded in 2015 with the purpose of promoting and improving the rights to privacy and personal data protection in Chile. The organization aims to encourage public debate and influence the discussion on a national and regional level, promoting the right to privacy and personal data protection with a focus on dignity, equal rights, and freedom of speech.

#### Authors:

Javiera Moreno Andrade, Danny Rayman Labrín, Camila Monsalva Palavecino, Trinidad Moreno Silva, Manuel Escobar Pacheco y Paulina Olivera Castro.

>>>>

Edited by Valentina Camilla Araya.

Designed by Lucas Núnez Saavedra

Traslated by Leonardo Villarroel

## > INDEX

> PRESENTATION	3
> FROM IDENTIFYING TO IDENTIFICATION SYSTEMS	
IDENTIFICATION CARD AND NATIONAL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER	7
RUN AS PERSONAL DATA	7
OBTENTION OF RUN FOR MIGRANTS IN CHILE.	8
> COMPARATIVE EXPERIENCE: IDENTIFICATION SYSTEMS IN THE WORLD	10
INDIA: AADHAAR PROJECT	10
KENYA: HUDUMA NAMBA	11
UGANDA: NDAGA MUNTU	12
> MIGRANT EXPERIENCE IN CHILE	14
REGULAR MIGRANTS	
Methodological context	
Description of the group of regular or in the process of becoming regular migrants	
Migration and its documentation.	
Document obtention process	
Obtention of definitive documentation	21
Identity document privacy	
Suggestions for the authorities	23
Lessons	
THE EXPERIENCE OF UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANTS	
Methodological context	
Description of the group of migrants in irregular condition.	
Document and arrival to Chile	
Lack of RUN and stay in Chile	
Suggestions	
Lessons	
> RECRUITERS EXPERIENCE	
METHODOLOGICAL CONTEXT	
RESULTS	
Company context and inclusion	
Work and migrants	
Migrant work and documentation	
Suggestions	
Lessons	
> EMPIRICAL EXPERIMENT: HOW DOES THE RUN NUMBER AFFECT THE MIGRANTS' ACCESS TO WORK?	
Sample size	
Database structure	
Sending the curriculum	
ECONOMETRIC RESULTS.	48
Tabla 1. Ordinary least squares and logit results in the probability of being contacted for an	
interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job	
Tabla 2. Multinomial logit results for the probability of being in one of the six categories	
Tabla 3. Ordinal logit results for the probability of receiving a certain number of answers	
> CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.	
> REFERENCES	55

## ><>><>><>> >< <><<< ><<>><<<><<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<<>><<>><<<>><<>><<<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><< >>>> < < 🧠 <<< <<><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><<>><

### > PRESENTATION

Throughout history, various methods have been employed to achieve the identification of citizens. Said mechanisms have undergone modifications and evolution, leading to what is today, at least in our country, the institutionally-recognized identification system that is the identification card: a unique national number that contains data such as name, tax identification number, picture, date of birth, document number, amongst others.

The Chilean State has invested systematic efforts on the task of optimizing and implementing public policies that lead to a greater modernization of the State apparatus. However, in the case of migration, the exponential grow of the migratory flows has led to a greater demand for this document, and there have been no improvements to the situation of migrants coming to our country, as the obtention of a visa -and, consequentially, of the identification document – is a tedious, long and inefficient process that relegates them to helplessness and unemployment.

Presently, the RUT number of people is indispensable for most paperwork and services that they may wish to have access to, The relationship between the State and its citizens is mediated by this number for the effects of recognition and identification, and it is not only the relationship of the people with the State that is mediated by the RUT, but many times, it also affects those that are established between private parties, in which its absence prevents the writing of work contracts; and it has become increasingly frequent for that number to be used in commercial exchanges, for buying or selling goods; or even to have access to certain places or particular domiciles. All of this without even mentioning all the commercial benefits and discounts that mandate that one provides this information.

As such, not having this identification creates an adverse situation for migrants, and this adversity is increased as the analysis goes deeper: they find themselves in a foreign country, without the necessary agility to obtain their temporary or definitive residency, which is what will grant them their RUT number (which would only be valid as long as the visa is as well) and that allows them to access activities and services such as work, health services, educational establishments, social security, amongst others.

In this way, it becomes evident that the stagnation of the process for obtaining residencies directly impacts on the living condition of migrants, in the context of many of them arriving without having contacts in this country, or without a previously accorded work contract, and they can linger for months, or even a year waiting to be assigned their residency and, ultimately, their RUT number.

The aforementioned notwithstanding, the number that is assigned to those who are not native to the country does not concur with their age, making evident that they are not Chilean nationals only by the number of millions in their cypher, thus opening a new flank for discrimination.

Throughout this report we will expose, empirically and in-depth, the issues and consequences that we have just introduced, comparing the situation of those who already have their RUT and does who do not; thus highlighting the essential processes for obtention of the residency in Chile, the principal forms of discrimination that those who come to the country face, and the vulnerating of their rights to which they are exposed solely by not having a Chilean RUT, as this is the datum that authorities request the most when conducting security inspections.



## FROM IDENTIFYING TO IDENTIFICATION SYSTEMS

From the beginnings of civilization there have been various attempts at identifying people through several systems. At first, efforts were focused in the task of differentiating criminals from common citizens, through barbaric identification systems that defiled human dignity.

In France, the skin of those who committed crimes was branded with burning irons: from fleurs-de-lis to letters and initials were branded in the back and forehead of the individual. These customs were suppressed by the French Revolution, but afterwards they were reinstated up until 1823<sup>1</sup>.

As time and culture progressed, such means of identification became intolerable for society, as such degree of cruelty implied a vulnerating people's dignity, as it constituted both a way of identification and a permanent sentence on their bodies. Thus, new identification systems were born, with the prevalence of Vucetich's dactyloscopy and the anthropometric system complemented with Bertillón's descriptive sketch or identikit.

Later on, the invention of photography was considered to be useful for these purposes. However, the practical impossibility of finding a specific picture amongst the myriad available in legal collections, as well as voluntary physiological modification by criminals were hurdles that rendered this method unsustainable.

It is within this context that in Chile, in 1884 the Civil Registry Law is passed. The following year, the first offices of the Civil Registry begin operating throughout the country, under the charge of a civil officer; but it would not be until 1924 when Law Decree N° 26 establishing the Mandatory Personal Identification Service, and Decree N° 102, creating the Passport and Identification Service are proclaimed.

Article No 1 from Decree 26 states that: "It is therefore established in the Republic the mandatory personal obligation service, in accordance with the Juan Vucetich system and Alfonso Bertillón's morphological description". Thus, creating the National Identification Card.

Although the origins of personal identification systems have been influenced by punitivism and prosecution, conceived as systems that were created to recognize and associate criminals with sentences, it was then opened up to victims and later on to the rest of the citizens. Nowadays, these intensions have been concretely merged, as -in the case Chile- it is the Civil Registry and Identification Service (SRCEI from now on) the public institution that provides a national identity number and keeps registry of people's defunctions and filiations, along with their legal and criminal records. Therefore, the foundational purpose of identification systems is retained to this day.

In 1930, Organic Law N° 4.808 on the Civil Registry Service was announced in 10 February 1930, with the Service's Organic Regulation becoming official in August of that same year, in accordance with Justice Law Decree 2,128, which established the procedures by which the recording of births, marriages, defunctions and other acts and contacts regarding the civil state of people were to take place.

As such, the SRCEI's organization can be traced back to 1943, to the Decree with Force of Law N° 51-71102, which merged the Civil Registry Service with the Identification Service that was created on November 18th of 1924, and which depended on the Ministry of Justice<sup>2</sup>.

Thus, the national identification number begun to be used in our country. The Civil Registry and Identification Service had, initially, as its sole objective the accreditation of people's identity.

This purpose changed in 1969 with the implementation of the Unique Tax Number (RUT), which was reinforced by the creation of the Coordination Commission for the Implementation of the Unique Number through the National Computer System and Decree 18 from 1973, by the Ministry of National Defense, which established a Unique Identification Number for the purposes of identification and statistics, which ultimately led to the creation of what we now know as the Unique Identification Number (RUN).

However, it was not until 1982 that the registry system underwent a transcendental transformation, by implementing the computer system that allowed the merging of the manually collected information with a database that incorporated the registries of birth, marriage and defunction, which led to the immediate attainment of a certificate trough any of the offices of the Civil Registry in the country that possessed a computer terminal<sup>3</sup>

#### **IDENTIFICATION CARD AND NATIONAL IDENTIFICATION NUMBER**

The national identification card is an official document that certifies the identity of a Chilean individual. Amongst the information it contains we can find: the individual's full name, National Identification Number (RUN) and sex; as well as their photo, signature, and fingerprint<sup>4</sup>.

This document is considered a public document and it is granted along with the assignation of RUN number, which at first contained the registry of births, marriages and defunctions.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Belmar & Pérez, 1991, p.82.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Belmar & Pérez, 1991, p.86.

In fact, every person who is born in Chile has a birth certificate generated for them, as well as a unique, non-reusable, RUN number assigned to them. All vital facts are assigned to this number, thus registering them into the system, with their unique number as reference.

The birth and defunction registries also contain statistical data that refers to the level of education of the parents, marital status, quality of the household, birthing data such as length of pregnancy, weight upon birth, place of birth and more. In the case of defunction registries, these include, data related to the cause of death, quality of the physician, time of death, level of education of the deceased, amongst others<sup>5</sup>.

These registries refer to a person, and therefore are linked, allowing the public to obtain any kind of automatic certificate just by presenting the RUN number, from which currently more data can be retrieved, as various other registries have been incorporated, such as: the National Registry of Professionals<sup>6</sup>; National Registry of Family Violence<sup>7</sup>; General Registration of Sentences, Passports, the Motor Vehicles Registry; the Narcotics Trafficking Registry, just to name a few.

#### **RUN AS PERSONAL DATA**

The RUN's identity number is comprised of two sections, the correlative number separated (by a dash) from a verification digit from 0 to 9 or the letter K, which is obtained from an algorithmic processing of the correlative number. The verification digit validates the RUN or RUT, so that this number can have only one verification digit in order to prevent frauds.

Normally, points are used to separate the thousand units, so that the format is the following: XX.XXX.XXX-Y, where X is a digit and Y is either a digit or the letter K.

In our report "I am a migrant, and my information is in your hands"<sup>8</sup>, we discussed the legal qualification of the RUN as personal data: "In this regard, the Council for Transparency has considered that, in the case of a request for access to documents that act are possession of the Public Administration and that contain the RUN of one or more individuals who are not public servants, this information should be safeguard, as is to be considered personal data, to which access can only be granted with the consent of its owner or when the law so establishes"<sup>9</sup>.

In parallel, the Supreme Court "has considered that the collection, storage and treatment of the RUN is valid and does not require the authorization of its owner, as long as it is obtained from a public dominion source -in this case, the Voter Roll elaborated by the Voter Registry before each election, as demanded by article 32 of Law N° 18,566- as this will fall under the purview of Decree with Force of Law N° 3, from January 15, 1969, which creates the concept of RUT from an economic, financial and commercial data, which, according to national legislation, coincides

<sup>8</sup> Fundación Datos Protegidos and Infomigra (2020).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> https://www.chileatiende.gob.cl/fichas/3430-cedula-de-identidad-obtencion-y-renovacion

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Véase Belmar & Pérez, 1991, p. 87

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Law 19,284, which creates the National Disability Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Law 19,325, which creates the National Family Violence Registry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Council for Transparency Chile, 2011, p. 20.

with the RUN of each and every individual"<sup>10</sup>.

This coincides with how common it is for our identification number to be asked of us whenever we acquire goods, hire services, and even gain entry to particular places such as buildings and condominiums.

In commerce, they are used as client loyalty techniques that imply some benefits for the consumer. For example, they promote the access to promotions and to point-reward systems from a given retail company. But the truth is that the interest on our information goes way beyond our loyalty as clients.

In truth, what lies behind is profiling, for when we provide our RUN we are making data cross-referencing possible. The data that companies get from people allow to produce complete behavior profiles, which leads to the creation of increasingly detailed profiles in order to conduct personalized campaigns for a number of audiences.

All of the aforementioned allows us to maintain that, as people provide small pieces of their information, what happens is that, beyond the cash registers the story of their whole lives is being gathered, stories that belong to their most intimate and private aspect of themselves, and thus they lose control of their shared information.

#### **OBTENTION OF RUN FOR MIGRANTS IN CHILE**

The national identity card for foreigners is granted to migrant people who have a temporary or definitive stay permit in the country; however, it is an interim type of identification and only allows the fulfillment of individual tax duties. In fact, the RUN will be valid as long as their visa also is.

For natives, there is a clear correlation between a person's age and their RUN number. For example, Chilean natives between 30 and 32 years old mostly have an ID number in the 17 or 18 millions (17.XXX.XXX-X). However, a migrant of the same age has a much larger RUN (28.XXX.XXX-X). Therefore, an identifier such as the RUN can easily by linked to a migrant person, even without any further data from that person, which can easily become a source of discrimination.

As of recent, there have efforts at a State level to modernize the visa-application system for foreigners. However, these efforts have not had a substantial impact on the unfavorable circumstances that the migrant population faces upon arriving to the country.

One of said attempts is the Unique Migratory Card, a document that is provided only in border crossings that permit the transit of migrants. Its obtention is dependent on the individual's regular entry to Chile.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Fundación Datos Protegidos & Infomigra, 2020, p.14.

Regarding its effects, modernization shows no intention of solving the problem that has recently been created by the Unique Migratory Card, and it even imposes more access barriers for a visa application for, in order to request it, a phone number and e-mail address are mandatory requisites.

With that being said, two of the causes for a visa application not being considered are:

- > Having an expired tourism card and/or working without authorization
- Having some restriction preventing from the application (expulsion from the country, visa rejection, pending application, prohibition from entering the country)

And the common requisites for the application to the Unique Migratory Card:

- Photocopy of Passport (identification page, number and dates of granting and expiration, stamped upon entry. Also, if applicable, photocopy of the Tourist visa).
- > Photocopy of last Tourist Cardo or Unique Migratory Card (TUM).

## COMPARATIVE EXPERIENCE: IDENTIFICATION SYSTEMS IN THE WORLD

Now, we will show some cases of identity systems around the world, particularly three examples from the global south, which share certain characteristics with the Chilean system, but have accounted for situations of exclusion between marginalized and vulnerable population, as the migrant population:

#### **INDIA: AADHAAR PROJECT**

Aadhaar Project (Aadhaar from now on) is the world's largest biometric identification system, and it comprises a unique 12-digit number that is issued to residents of India, which also contains demographic and biometric information<sup>11</sup>.

From its inception, it has been stated that one of Aadhaar's main objectives has been to improve the provision of government subsidies and social benefits, as well as to reduce corruption and inefficiency in India<sup>12</sup>.

In order to have access to benefits, subsidies and services in India, it is required to have the Aadhaar system's authentication or to have proof of having an Aadhaar unique number, in order to ensure that only the rightful recipients can make the most of the benefits of India's Public Distribution System (PDS)<sup>13</sup>.

Regarding this, the Centre for Communication Governance of Delhi's National Law University indicates that there is a series of traditional social assistance schemes in India that involve the provision of benefits in goods, such as cereal<sup>14</sup>.

The use of Aadhaar in these cases has been considered as a way of implementing the transfer of direct benefits, as well as in the case of the delivery of monetary benefits . However, despite the good intentions that may be signaled for the implementation of this system, truth is that the experience gathered by various investigations account for a system that has increased the exclusion of vulnerable and marginalized groups<sup>16</sup>.

Access Now, has visibilized that millions of people in India have suffered from the introduction of this system in the social care plans<sup>17</sup>, mentioning that "thousands of ration card

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Singh & Krishna, 2018, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Singh & Krishna, 2018, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Singh & Krishna, 2018, p. 3; Ravichandra, 2021, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Singh & Krishna, 2018, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Singh & Krishna, 2018, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Access Now, p. 9; Ravichandra, 2021, s/p; Panigrahi, 2021, p. 26; Singh & Krishna, 2018, pp. 8-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Access Now, p. 9.

have been cancelled with no previous notice nor clear ways of reparation. Over a million children were denied access to school. Women had a harder time accessing their maternity benefits and State-program workers were denied their salaries"<sup>18</sup>.

The Aadhaar-induced exclusion has led even to death by human endangerment such as starvation or denial of health services<sup>19</sup>. Many hospitals refused to accept other means of identification, asking for the Aadhaar, arguing that the process of registration through other means was laborious and took too much time<sup>20</sup>, despite the government not considering it a requisite to have access to vaccines.

In the case of refugees, there have been cases in which the denial of essential services due to a lack of Aadhaar number has been documented, such as the denial of enrollment in State schools, prohibition from taking national exams; and access to everyday services such as acquiring a SIM card, opening bank accounts, renting a house, seeking opportunities for sustenance, or even accessing private hospitals, which has ultimately led to refugees being constantly excluded from access to various services<sup>21</sup>.

#### **KENYA: HUDUMA NAMBA**

In 2019 Kenya implemented the National Integrated Identity Scheme (NIIMS), also known as Huduma Namba<sup>22</sup>. At first, the Kenyan government mandated that all their citizens (including those living abroad and all foreigners and refugees living in Kenya that were over 6 years old) obtained the national identification document.

The obtention of the national identification document is a requisite to access all of the essential government services in the country, including the electoral registry, birth certificates, civil marriages certificates, tax records, real estate taxes and property deeds<sup>23</sup>.

This demands the presentation of a large number of biometric data, such as fingerprints, earlobes, retina and iris patterns, voiceprints, and digital-format DNA<sup>24</sup>. However, Kenya's Superior Tribunal ruled in January 2020 that the collection of data such as DNA with the purpose of identification was invasive and unnecessary, stating that it was not authorized nor specifically linked to the relevant legislation<sup>25</sup>, thus halting the execution of the project until an adequate and comprehensive normative framework could be established<sup>26</sup>.

In spite of these rulings, the government of Kenya has continued collecting and processing data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Access Now, p. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Sahay, 2019, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Rao, 2021, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Roshni, 2018, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Asamblea General de Naciones Unidas, 2019, para 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Consejo de Derechos Humanos de Naciones Unidas, 2020, para. 40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Asamblea General de Naciones Unidas, 2019, para 18.

In November 2020, the government announced that the national identification card would be gradually eliminated and replaced by Huduma Namba cards<sup>27</sup>, which are currently in their second phase<sup>28</sup>. With regards to this issue, on October 2021, Kenya's Supreme Tribunal ordered the government to conduct a study on the impact in data protection before implementing Huduma Namba cards<sup>29</sup>. However, the system's implementation process is still ongoing.

Just like in India's case, this system has been criticized due to the exclusion of certain vulnerable groups it generates. One of the main documented problems so far has been those of the people that are registered in the Kenyan government's refuge database, and who have been denied the registration in Huduma Namba.

By the end of the 1980s and the beginning of the 90s, thousands of Somalian refugees fled to Kenya as a result of the civil war that ravaged their country, and faced a severe drought<sup>30</sup>. Within this context, a large number of Somalian-Kenyan registered in the refugee system in order to have access to social benefits and health<sup>31</sup>. As such, many people were registered in the refugee database, including children and teenagers.

Those who are in said database have been prevented from accessing Kenya's national identification services, even when they provide proof of their Kenyan citizenship, which has led them to become unable to have Access to a number of services from the private sector, as well as from State-provided benefits<sup>32</sup>.

It is necessary to point out that there have been diverse criticism regarding the barriers that prevent the access to the necessary documentation to obtain the Huduma Namba number<sup>33</sup>, which has affected mostly ethnic minorities and marginalized groups, preventing them from attaining this identification as well as all the benefits and provision that it grants access to<sup>34</sup>.

#### **UGANDA: NDAGA MUNTU**

In 2014 Uganda started the implementation of a national digital identification system called "Ndaga Muntu", which started out as a national security project<sup>35</sup>.

<sup>26</sup> Nubian Rights Forum & 2 others v. Attorney General & 6 other, Tribunal Supremo de Kenia, 30 de enero de 2020, para. 1047.3

- <sup>30</sup> Privacy International, 2021, s/p.
- <sup>31</sup> Privacy International, 2021, s/p.
- <sup>32</sup>Weitzberg, 2020, s/p; Privacy International, 2021, s/p.
- <sup>33</sup> Cullen, 2020, s/p.
- <sup>34</sup> Cullen, 2020, s/p.
- <sup>35</sup> Center for Human Rights and Global Justice et all, 2021, p. 8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Nubian Rights Forum & 2 others v. Attorney General & 6 other, Tribunal Supremo de Kenia, 30 de enero de 2020, para. 1047.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Kimuyu, 2020, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Kenya News, 2021, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Muya, 2021, s/p.

Presently, to obtain an identification document, the process is based on the collection of all the fingerprints and a high-resolution photography of the individual's face.

These biometrical data is stored in the intelligent chip of the identification document, alongside a computer barcode in the back of the card that allows for the data to be validated and retrieved, so many of the institutions that require Ndaga Muntu authentication used machines that can read the card's barcode<sup>36</sup>.

According to a recent report from Unwanted Witness, the use of this identification system in the country, which has slowly become the only legally accepted national identification document, limits the exercise of fundamental rights in Uganda. The report also states that during the process of implementation exclusion, inequality and discrimination are exacerbated, particularly amongst the destitute<sup>37</sup>. Their research shows that in order to access health services and migration offices it is required to have a Ndaga Muntu card<sup>38</sup>. Likewise, in order to access private, third-party services, such as obtaining a SIM card or opening a bank account; or hotel and educational services, it was mandatory of them to have the Ndaga Muntu identification document<sup>39</sup>.

Additionally, it is relevant to highlight that during the Covid-19 pandemic, the Ndaga Muntu system has been heavily criticized because it has left a third of the adult population, including vulnerable groups, without access to the benefits and services that require its obtention<sup>40</sup>.

In various occasions, the country's authorities have stated that Ndaga Muntu will be required to access health services, even for vaccination against Covid-19<sup>41</sup>. With regards to this, due to legal actions from NGOs against this restriction, the government has had to take a step back and allow vaccination without registration. However, the risks regarding the exclusion of vulnerable population remain present<sup>42</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Unwanted Witness, 2021, p. 10; Center for Human Rights and Global Justice et all, 2021, p. 41.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Unwanted Witness, 2021, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Unwanted Witness, 2021, p. 28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Unwanted Witness, 2021, p. 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Taylor, 2021, s/p; Hersey, 2021, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>Taylor, 2021, s/p.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Taylor, 2021, s/p.

### > MIGRANT EXPERIENCE CHILE

#### **REGULAR MIGRANTS**

#### Methodological context

Given the context that has been brought about the humanitarian crisis from the considerable migratory flows in Chile, it was somewhat difficult to find migrants who wanted to personally attend the focus groups of this investigation.

Despite this, the three sessions of conversation considered three of the four most massive foreign colonies in our country: Venezuela, Haiti, and Colombia. It is important to clarify that the Peruvian colony classifies as a different group, as it is a group that has a much older history in this country compared to the countries that this report considers.

In the case of the migrant groups from Colombia and Venezuela, these had their definitive RUT and visa. On the contrary, the Haitian group was mostly without a visa and had their temporary RUT.

#### Description of the group of regular or in the process of becoming regular migrants

- > They have been in Chile for 4 to 7 years.
- > They left their country for political and financial reasons.
- In the cases of Venezuela, Haiti and Colombia, the reasons that were mostly mentioned were personal and financial.
- Coming to Chile was marked by their perception of the country as a stable and orderly place, especially in financial terms.
- In the time they first came, entry and stay in the country were simpler. This was due, for the Haitians, to Chile being the only Latin American country that did not ask them for an entry visa; Venezuelans could quickly validate their professional titles and work in their professions; and all three nationalities could then enter the country as tourists and then regularize their situation.
- Most of them have relatives or friends who came before them and helped them through the process of settling in.

> All of the interviewees came to the country on a tourist's visa; Venezuelans and Haitians by air, Colombians by land.

Soy educadora de párvulos, cuando llegué a Santiago trabajé como asesora del hogar puertas adentro. Ahí tuve la oportunidad de que me dieran contrato y con ese contrato llegó mi primera visa" (Venezuela). "We came in 2014 to get to know the country, as tourists. We liked it, it caught our eye, and we began the paperwork to remain here. We then went back to Venezuela, and we followed all the procedures (college papers, birth and marriage certificates, etc.) We returned as tourists and once we were here we presented all the documentation and got certified by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and then we began to look for a job" (Venezuela).

> "It is easier to enter Chile than all other countries. The Haitian passport is blocked in almost every country. You cannot travel if you do not have a visa. Chile had no visa at the time" (Haití).

Even though at first it was not a pleasant experience for everyone, overall they like being here. They say that Chile has offered them chance to rise, to achieve financial stability.

Most of them have their families alongside them, whereas others started one in Chile and have Chilean children.

> "I am a Colombian, I have lived 6 years in Chile, my husband is Chilean, we have a 3-year-old baby, who is Chilean. A year ago I started to work again, as I had stopped because of the baby. I have worked at an optician store ever since I came to Chile" (Colombia).

#### Migration and its documentation

Of the interviewees, all of them came with their passport. Only one Venezuelan came with their country's national identification card, knowing that it is the most important document when it comes to migration.

> "I came in a very regular fashion, with my passport and about a thousand dollars. As she said, I came "with one hand on the front and the other one in the back". For instance, my bag had all the clothes of the friend who had assisted me" (Colombia).

From what we discussed, we could observe that Venezuelans were the ones who sought the most information before coming, whereas Colombians mostly came first and then in Chile found out about the steps they needed to follow through formal and informal channels, such as:

- > Formal channels as the Civil Registry or National Migration Service websites.
- > Through blogs or Facebook communities from their countries in Chile.
- In the specific case of Venezuela, they also gather information from the Chilean embassy.
- In the case of Colombia, they gather information from their bosses, which is generally not quality information.

They prefer informal channels (people or social networks) as these are the only instances in which they can find information that comes from experiences, thus allowing to clear their doubts.

> "One trusts more in the experience of people, because often one hears so many different things that one does not understand or gets more confused. Then, you take the experience of others, you see how they have fared and so on, and though many times you do not get the best information, then you try to make the most with what you got" (Colombia).

> "Many times one does not understand what the different sites or documents says, so then your friends comment on those sites and then everybody clarifies the terms a little more, doubt by doubt. Thus, more light is shed" (Venezuela).

> "Here, we had not much information, besides the one provided by Government agents. In the Chilean embassy in Venezuela, if one wanted to stamp or legalize something (back then, no stamp was needed) they would legalize it, but they did not know what would be the use of the documents here. This kind of information was not available, only the information on how to legalize birth certificates, college degrees and that was it. So you had to check on these Facebook blogs and gather information little by little. And, as I told you, you got in touch with the friends you had in Chile" (Venezuela).

Probably to their greater knowledge on the subject, it was the Venezuelans who came with all their paperwork and titles up to date, so their entry to Chile was easier.

Today, all of them are well aware of the process and can clearly describe the documents and processes that someone must go through in order to obtain their visa, as they are a group that had to face a change in government and in the migration protocols and laws. As such, they have had to become very well acquainted with the adjustment to legislation.

\* "Too many things changed from Bachelet to Piñera. President Bachelet had a temporary visa which you could ask for with a work contract and that allowed you to study, work, do anything, for a year. Then, when you had to renew it, you had to had a way of renewing it. If you were studying, it was a studies; if you were working, it was work. When you went for your visa renewal, and you had been working all the time and had 9 continuous contributions, they saw that you were working or studying, then you could ask for a permanent residency. That is 'I have a job, I will obviously be staying a little longer. I will stay here", then you asked for the definitive one'" (Haití).

#### **Document obtention process**

Although some had more difficult than others finding a job, in those days there were less migrants and therefore less employers willing to hire them. Sooner or later, all of them found jobs.

Once they had a contract, all nationalities quickly obtained their temporary RUT and visa. For those who manage to regularize their situation before the law was changed, the definitive visa or RUT was also obtained quite quickly.

"I was able to work with my temporary visa. It lasted for a year, so I asked for it in December, I applied with the contract I got with my then boss and my Passport and by March I already had my temporary ID card" (Colombia).

> "I started during Bachelet. Back then, the Foreign Affairs department worked so and so. It was about 5-6 months and then I had my RUT" (Haití).

> "I got my RUT by my third month. By my first month I had my work permit and by the third one I got the RUT. I immediately opened the BancoEstado account, and well, in those days it was also faster. Besides, as Rosa said about the immigration flow and the pandemic factor, these have all made Foreign Affairs and Migration and the Civil Registry take way too long for all documents" (Venezuela). > "I was quick to get the first temporary one. With that, I had my contract by the third month. It lasted for a year. I had no problems whatsoever" (Colombia).

#### > "When I first came, I went and in 15 days I had my temporary RUT" (Haití).

And though most experienced complex everyday situations before obtaining their temporary RUT, they mention, in general, situations that range from unpleasantries to certain spaces of abuse. In this regard, they all feel a sense of vulnerability because of being undocumented.

> "At least in Venezuela, your invoice is any receipt that you give a person from a purchase. Not here, though, if you are a regular person, you get a bill, and if you are a legal entity, you get an invoices. So, invoice or bill? I said invoice. Your RUT, please? I did not know what a RUT was. An invoice is, to me, the invoice from my purchase, so I would tell her: "Lady, my invoice", and she would say "Yes, but I need your RUT"... "But I do not have a RUT, give me my invoice". That was an awkward moment, for they had to explain to me, the lady had to understand that I had just arrived in the country, and then she could explain me everything" (Venezuela).

> "I lost my phone and I wanted to get my chip back. Ever since I came to Chile, I've had the same chip. So they say to me: Your RUT? And I gave them my ID card from 2018, expired, with the statement of having my papers in process of approving, and they tell me "no, I cannot give you the other chip, because your ID is expired and the system won't register it". So I tell them "but it does register it when it's time to pay; and when I asked for it, my RUT was also expired... I didn't even have a RUT". Then, of course, I told the girl "please delete this number, or otherwise it'll show on my credit report and I will appear to have a debt for something that I always pay on time", and she told me "no, I cannot delete it". So, do I have to keep on paying without using the chip? And she said yes. So, when someone wants to do something... there will always be a way to do things. Then she spoke to a supervisor and they installed the chip" (Haití).

> "I remember that I already had the document, but my son didn't. My son had just arrived in the country, and I wasn't home when the officers of the Investigative Police came, it was very strange. It had never happened to me before. They stopped me and asked for my documents. My ID card had expired, but I was a regular inmigrant in any case, as I had went through the entire process. We had gone jogging with my son through Pocuro. So I tell them, that I have no documents, but I lived there, should they need them, I can go get them, and they say to me "what's your RUT?", so I gave them my RUT and it didn't come up on the system, and then he says "What about him?" And I tell him that he is my son, but he has just arrived and came to visit. "Any document of his?" And I told him that I had nothing, but that my house was over there. I don't know if they had a special analytical superpower, but he told me "Ok, carry on jogging". (Colombia)

> "Having to go clean these houses and getting paid 10-12 thousand pesos with no lunch or anything, I think that is... with the ID card I can seek another job or ask for a raise, but without my ID I cannot" (Colombia).

After obtaining the temporary visa, and with the experience of other immigrants, their stay with the temporary ID card was more rewarding, which made their lives easier and granted them access to various services that had been previously denied to them.

> "My experience was the same. I had no problems. With my passport I was able to rent a place, I did all my paperwork, everything" (Colombia).

"In places were we knew they would allow us to rent. One of the companies that became quite famous amongst Venezuelans was Bluehome and Acelplan. They provided many opportunities for foreigners; in fact, if you showed your Passport with a degree or any other document, they gave you payment options. I'm speaking about back then, I don't know how things are now. I don't know how the negotiations carried on afterwards" (Venezuela).

However, the temporary ID card does not always put an end to abuse for Haitians:

"The Chilean press comes here and shows "look how these Haitians live, stacked in one small room", but... who rented that room to them? Who owns the room? It belongs to a Chilean. Why was a room rented to them in such conditions? Why do they criticize the person that is renting the room in those conditions?" (Haití).

> "If you go to rent an apartment and tell them "I have a RUT, but it is expired", they tell you alright, super. But if the apartment is with a realtor, the realtor would say "no, you have to have the definitive permit", and you can't rent from them. Sometimes, a realtor would say "if you are in the process of legalization, I'll take it" and if the realtor approves, you're alright" (Venezuela).

The process of obtaining a definitive visa can be slow, but in general is not that the documentation requested of them is hard to obtain.

> "In my case, it was very easy. A picture and college degree, they didn't ask for background checks in those days. It was very simple, very easy" (Venezuela).

> ""It wasn't difficult for me, because they would only sent you the day in which you had to go, so you would get your appointment and you knew when you had to go, you went there, they talked to you and there was nothing more to it" (Colombia).

> "I had it the normal way, and I was lucky, for I had to stay two years under the same employer, although I was in those times, I don't remember if it was Piñera or Bachelet who passed a law that had foreigners only having to be for one year with the same employer in order for them to get their definitive permit, so I got the temporary one and with my contract I moved to the definitive one" (Colombia).

> "• "It is a requisite needed to stay in the country, to be legal, to have your ID card, like all Chileans need their ID card for a contract, for their contributions; one has to be in equal conditions" (Colombia).

For Haitians, the process was not the same. They find themselves going through a sequence of temporary visas for years without understanding why they are not getting their definitive visas.

> "I have been working in Chile since day 1. One fills up all the requisites, you send them and then you are stuck. It is as if it was a filter. If it was a robot saying "no, not here", but if it is a regular person, coming in a very bad mood and says "no, I don't like this one, I don't like the face in the picture, rejected". I think it must be like this, because it is a person making it. If you are in a bad mood, you reject and reject. Because there are people that get their definitive permit in 5-6 months, and they haven't worked a day".

> "I have a friend that has been in Chile for 4 years. He has had the same job during those 4 years, has paid all of his contributions, paid for his health plan, paid for everything. He has two Chilean sons going to a

Chilean school and he has been denied the definitive permit twice".

> "You don't have fines, you don't have anything, Why was I rejected then? You cannot face any officer: Why did you reject me?"

"I have been here for 3 years and since I got here I've had one job. I have worked only in one company. Now I have over 40 payslips. Everything was paid in due time, I never switched jobs or companies".

All of them are in some state of expired temporary visa, but in the process of obtaining the definitive one. Because of the pandemic, they can still use those documents. Some of them have renewed their temporary visa. However, this document does not give them all the benefit they hope and need.

> "Foreign affairs did nothing during the pandemic. And the president tried to fix everything by saying "we extend the date of the ID card", but it did not account for those who lost their card. And in second place, despite having all my documents in order, for Foreign Affairs I am legally living in Chile, but I cannot open a bank account nor get a chip for the phone I lost... there is a lot of paperwork I just cannot do".

"There is a lot of paperwork. I even had my son a while ago, and he is only registered by my name, but my RUT is not on my son's birth certificate. And if you go through the system, my husband has the name of my son, but if I go through the system and look for "children", he does not appear registered as my son, because my ID number was not there, because my ID card had expired, when I'm supposed to be a regular in Chile. So, there are many things that cannot be really done in practice. Even though they say "yes, we extended the serials, we provided with option …", in practice, in the foreigner's day-by-day, you cannot do anything with that expired ID card".

When facing everyday needs, the ID card leaves the Haitians we consulted at the mercy and good will of whomever tends to said needs. They are still unable to get a driver's license or have a bank account, despite all of the years they have been living in Chile. They can only have a RUT account and hire some services, always depending on who tends to them.

We have heard the opinion of Haitians regarding the way in which these institutions works, as they do not obtain an affirmative response to their requests. However, in the case of Colombians and Venezuelans, their evaluation is different. Most of them recognize that the process in their time of migration was easier, quicker and with better service, both in Foreign Affairs and with the Investigative Police and the Civil Registry.

> "In my case, it was different: I arrived way before Rosa and everything was scheduled. The times I went to Foreign Affairs it was because they sent me an appointment, and with the papers for my appointment I went, and stayed in line, but it was not a long line, they respected the schedule as they assigned the appointments, so I had 10 or 15 people before me, which wasn't much. And everything went really fast" (Venezuela).

> "For me it was also an expedite experience. There was a longer line, I remember; I think I was in line for a half a day at PDI. But the service was good. You came out feeling happy because the important thing was to follow the procedure and then nothing else mattered, I spent the morning in line, but I got what I wanted. It was a positive experience" (Venezuela).

> "Very fast. I remember that I went with a mate from work; we came there in a hurry and in a hurry wer left, there was no one there. We came, we did our paperwork and we left. It was as if they knew that I was expected at work" (Colombia).

However, those who had to conduct their paperwork after that period, just like Haitians, do not hold Foreign Affairs in the highest regard.

> "When we came in 2015 it was very easy. We would go to Foreign Affairs, then rushed to PDI and then to Civil Registry; in half a day you were done. Nowadays it is awful, because they don't even pick up the phone. They used to do it: you would do everything in half a day, now it is awful to even ask something because no one tells you anything and when they tell you something is misinformation. Then you don't know even who to ask anything. I call Foreign Affairs and they pick up in another city, the lady on the phone doesn't know what to say, because the phone lines in Santiago seem to be out order, because no one picks up. Everybody is supposed to get on the website and try to understand as much as you can, by reading, reading and get everywhere because otherwise you have no way of getting any information, there is no number you can call, nor someone to explain things for you" (Haití).

"I went to Foreign Affairs because I wanted to do everything in person, you could do it back then, there was no pandemic. They treated me like garbage: they said no, this has to be done through the website, that I had to read it and whatnot; or I would tell them that I understood what they were trying to tell me, but wouldn't they just listen to me and try to understand me, that I got into the website and it doesn't show up, it shows an error, it tells me that the platform is not working currently. They told me that it wasn't their problem. The first clash I had with immigration was that. They had a very despotic reaction and I was left with no desire to go back there" (Haití).

It happens that the main problem with Foreign Affairs has to do with the lack of direct contact with the department. The entire process is online and the results are delivered by e-mail, so in the case of a rejection they do not manage to understand the reasons and no one provides with an explanation, and becomes perceived as an arbitrary process that lacks transparency.

> "There's not even a way to communicate with Foreign Affairs. Now they moved to paperwork issue online and you have to wait for the e-mail to arrive. What comes into your e-mail, that is what it is. If the e-mail says you were rejected, you got rejected. You have no place in which to ask for a reason why. If they tell you that that you only got the temporary one, you got the temporary one. You have to accept what they tell you, what is there and what arrives at your house's mail" (Venezuela).

"If you comply with the requisites -especially if you don't get into trouble- and everything is in order, they should grant you the definitive stay, if you have not committed any felony, I think. I don't know what the deal is with saying "no, wait, I'll give you another temporary one", but... what for? I don't need it. I want to grow more. I cannot grow more with only the temporary. I want to live in a better place. I can't. So, they lock you up and then they themselves go with cameras, record you and ask: Why are you in such a destitute situation? Then they go and say that expectations were not enough for us. No, it wasn't the expectations, it was you who didn't want to give us the definitive stay, because I do comply with the requisites. They should at least tell me "we are not giving it to you, we are giving you the temporary one again, but when you come back, if you do this and that, we will give it to you" (Haití).

#### **Obtention of definitive documentation**

When migrants receive their ID card they acknowledge it as being of better quality and more modern than the one they had in their country of origin. They identify various elements that make the Chilean national ID a more vanguardist document than the one they had in their countries. Amongst the elements they mention are: the chip, fingerprint, holofoil, document number apart from the RUN, and it is, in general, perceived as a document with much more information than the one from their countries

In all their countries, the national ID card is provided once a person is of legal age and the document they receive was not mentioned to have a good material quality (with the exception of Colombia) and it was also said to contain a lot less information and, therefore, to be useful for a minor amount of paperwork.

> "The Haitian one has no fingerprint, it has less information" (Haití).

> "Comparing it to the Venezuelan one, which is a piece of paper, we are much more advanced here. Over there it is literally printed by a printer. For us, then, it is an innovation" (Venezuela).

> "The texture is the same, it is not a laminated sheet like they say; it's like this, in color. Some 20 years ago it was in black and white and they switched to color. The difference is that in Colombia you get your ID card when you are 18 and you remain with that one until the day you die or unless you want to change it. I'm 36 and I still look 18" (Colombia).

> "We do not have a document number, we only have the number on the card, but not a document number, that was new. The expiration, too; here, it expires, in Colombia it doesn't" (Colombia).

> "It has two pictures, one of which is a miniature and that resembles the coin, it has a large picture, and the serial number, which is very important for conducting any paperwork, the birthday and expiration date" (Venezuela).

> "That RUT tells you whether the person is foreign or not. I haven't seen a truly Chilean RUT, but the foreigner's RUT says "foreigner" right there in the heading of the picture".

They do not have the certainty that their RUN number is similar or different to that of Chilean citizens, though they do manage to recognize that their RUN number is similar to those of children. Venezuelans consider that, in their country, the difference between foreigners and Venezuelan citizens is the largest in terms of ID number.

> "I think it may be the document number, but I think that it is the RUN number... because my children are Chilean and they have similar numbers" (Colombia).

"For example: a person my age, if they are Chilean, will have a RUT between 9 and 13 millions, and mine is 26 millions. So, what I see is a different series, a different sequence" (Venezuela).

"I understand that they are following a continuity. Today a girl who is 20 has a RUT that is 25 or 27 millions, and the continuity follows. In Venezuela there is one for foreigners that follows a different numbering. For example, my father is a 3 millions, and my father-in-law is an 80 millions, because my he is a foreigner and my father is Venezuelan. Foreigners get a different numbering. I see that in Chile there is continuity from foreigners to Chileans. It is what I see, I don't know if this is the case" (Venezuela).

> "I think it is as he says; at least mine begins with 25 and my son's, who is Chilean, with 26. So it's a matter of continuity" (Colombia).

All in all, they consider that neither the number or any other element of the ID card is in itself a discriminatory element. The obtention of the definitive card is perceived only as a positive element, because with this document they have been able to have the emotional stability of feeling like people who are legally inhabiting another country. After obtaining the documentation, they identify the following benefits:

- > Buy cars
- > Open bank accounts, ask for loans
- Rent a domicile
- > Apply for grant
- > Opt for better jobs
- > Hire services
- > State benefits
- > Leaving and coming back to the country without any issues

> "With the definite stay you can ask for a mortgage loan if you want to buy a house... well, with the temporary one you can buy a car. With the definitive one you ask for a bank loan" (Venezuela).

> "With your ID card you get a contract without any problem" (Colombia).

> "You also get benefits in the location you are living, in terms of health and education. Yes, having an ID card is the best thing for a foreigner to have" (Colombia).

> "More than anything, it's the feeling of being legal. It is an emotional issue because you are no longer up in the air, more foreign than a foreigner. Not even a tourist, because you are no longer a tourist" (Venezuela).

> "Not be chased by the police; because one used to be walking down the street and they would come and ask for your papers" (Colombia).

> "One is settled in this country and says "I belong to this country, I need to be one of the people", then, when one gets one's ID card, one feels as part of the people, of society" (Venezuela).

> "I feel more protected, you feel victorious, like receiving a prize, that's the feeling. What a joy! Whereas others are living in the shadow, not having had an ID card for a year and so... they feel really overwhelmed, distressed. I used to feel like that" (Colombia).

> "The driver's license. The license is another very important thing that comes with your card, because without a license, you have to renew it from time to time" (Venezuela).

> "I receive the Emergency Family Income and my daughter goes to college for free. I have behaved well in this country and I pay my taxes" (Venezuela).

#### Identity document privacy

In general, the people we consulted do not have the slightest idea as to how the RUN works nor about the privacy of their data. Although it catches their attention that in Chile the RUT is asked for in all sorts of businesses and public and private services, they do not know when it is legal or not to ask for it and which companies or institutions are allowed to ask for it. As a matter of fact, if they had a problem with their RUN, they do not really know where to go for assistance (only one Colombian mentions that they must block it in the Civil Registry).

In this regard, despite it being the most modern identification document that they know, it is also the least private. Although they find it strange at first, they end up providing their RUN number in those spaces in which they feel it will benefit them.

> "Sometimes I think it's illegal, because there are many companies now, such as Movistar, ENTEL, Claro... They are always calling me. I don't know how it is that they have my data" (Haití).

> "In Colombia they ask for your ID, say, when you go to a liquor store for adults, but in the supermarket or everywhere else they do not ask for your card or number, it is supposed to be something personal" (Colombia).

> "In Venezuela they don't ask for your ID for anything at all, only when you go by a police detention point, when you are on the road and you may be going to Colombia, Brazil, I don't know. Only then. The rest of the time they do not ask for it, unless you are doing some paperwork at a bank, but they don't ask for in supermarkets nor stores nor anywhere else" (Venezuela).

"In Colombia there is more privacy, because, as I was telling you, they don't ever ask for it for anything. I don't even remember ever having had to carry my ID card with me, because you don't have to show it. So, it's not as private: in Colombia you never carry your card, unless you had to run a special errand that required it, but the rest of the time you don't" (Colombia).

> "My case is the same: I do not necessarily have to show my RUT, but I do have to know my number, because they ask for it everywhere. If I buy medicine from the drugstore they go "give me your RUT". That catches my attention as a different custom, but the habit ends up being created – this is the way in which the commerce in Chile works. So I give it spontaneously and that's it" (Venezuela).

#### Suggestions for the authorities

- > Establishment of a transparent process regarding the documents that are needed, the deadlines and reasons for every proceeding that is conducted.
- > Establishment of minimum and maximum reply times.
- > Regularization of those who have had temporary documents for years.
- > Have all process be easier and more efficient.
- > Clarification of paperwork rejections and how to solve them.
- > Have all proceedings be conducted in the same place.
- Incorporation of a customer service in the Foreign Affairs National Service in order to clear out doubts.

> "They must follow their own laws. Authorities are the ones that make the laws. You go into the Foreign Affairs website, and it says that you have to upload such and such papers and that the entire process should take 9 months... but you can wait for over 3 years" (Haití).

\* "Foreign Affairs is doing a bad job, because if they were doing a good one, they would not have people with 3 years of residence and their paperwork swamped... and its Director has been renewed in the position. We foreigners say that things have to change in Foreign Affairs for them to work. Perhaps it is a matter of changing the Director" (Haití).

> "The ones that may not be in this situation are those who have over 5 years here in Chile. And yet, there are some. I have been here for 6 years and here I am, my definitive stay has been denied 3 times... But there are some lucky one who have not had it denied once and have more than 3-4 years in Chile... but those who came right now, from 3 years ago, for the last 3 years, we are all swamped. Everyone has their documents swamped in Foreign Affairs. Supposedly, there was some changes in Foreign Affairs and things should be on the move, but there were people who had 2 years waiting, plus the pandemic... those are 3 years of swamped documents" (Haití).

> "At least we Colombians pay for a a more expensive ID card, because many times they do not approve them, and they have no idea as to why that was. So we lose money, time and we are not informed as to why we were denied. And the money is lost because they do not give it back. In this regard, there should be more transparency, the paperwork should be more expedite, faster, without so much fuss, because it's a whole ordeal to get it. And since they are charging for it, it shouldn't be like this; if it was free, let them take as long as they want, but we pay plenty for an ID card and we Colombians pay over 200,000 pesos. It is not fair that we have to wait for so long and to have it denied" (Colombia).

> "The paperwork should be faster for those of us who are already in, and each country's consulate should work in the proper manner to get the visas approved for people in their country of origin and who want to come here in a legal manner. If this could be done, I think the migrant flow through illegal border crossings would diminish" (Venezuela).

#### Lessons

- In general, the group of migrants that has spent the longest in Chile has had a good migration experience, given that the conditions that the country had for entry were easier to fulfill than the current.
- > The period that they spent without documents was brief, so the discomfort and abuse they suffered were experienced to a lesser degree or not at all.
- Of those who have been in Chile the longest, only Haitian migrants have felt discriminated, as they have legalization process of years, in which they have not been able to access their documentation and do not understand why they have not obtained the definitive residence. However, this has more to do with the process than with the documents themselves.

#### THE EXPERIENCE OF UNDOCUMENTED MIGRANTS

#### Methodological context

Given the pandemic context and the country's migrant crisis, it was not easy to find irregular migrants who wanted to participate of this study, and so the simple we were able to gather for this study consists only of Venezuelans and not from other countries that are also present in ours. Therefore, the results hereby presented reflect only the experience of this particular group.

#### Description of the group of migrants in irregular condition

The group of Venezuelan migrants who, at the time of this research, were living irregularly in Chile has the following characteristics:

- > They have been in Chile for less than a year and a half.
- They came through an illegal border crossing. Only in isolated cases they came through a legal entry point and with a tourist's visa.
- > Since they travel by land, the voyage to Chile has demanded a lot of effort.
- Some have migrated from other countries, mainly from Peru, where they have felt uncomfortable conditions, specially in labor terms (long hours, little money).
- > They have been defrauded and robbed during the way.
- > They get to Santiago and look for a job.
- > Given their lack of documents, they work on their own.

Part of their stories account for this situation:

"We made the crossing through Bolivia, and then they robbed us. They left us in the middle of nowhere... Now we can laugh about it, but at the time... the policemen took our money, they took some of our money. Once we had crossed from Bolivia to Chile they left us there, in the middle of the desert and they took all of our stuff. The good thing is that we had the IDs and some money left on us".

"I came on January 12. I came through an illegal crossing. I came with my 12-year-old daughter. It was right about the time in which they had these deportation planes. It was terrible, I had to spend 5 days in the streets, I couldn't get a place to spend the night, everything was full... I spent 15 days travelling. I came here and in 2 days I got an in-home job and I'm not doing really well".

\* "Fueron 9 días, y obviamente fue muy complicado, por el niño. Veníamos solamente porque mi esposo solo pudo costear 2 pasajes. Veníamos en bus. Él traía al más grande en piernas, y yo traía al de 8 meses en piernas. Sí había gente que nos ayudaban, porque nos veían cansados, y todo lo demás... pero sí fue rudo el viaje, fue largo. 9 días... uno dice que uno solo puede seguir bien, pero con niños es complicado".

"It was 9 days of traveling and it was obviously very complicated, because of the child. We came only because my husband was able to afford 2 tickets. We came by bus. He had our oldest in his lap and I had the 8-month-old in mine. People saw us and helped us, as they could see how tired we were... but it was a tough trip, it was long. 9 days... you think you may endure it on your own, but with children, it is complicated"

It is common for them to have relatives or friends in the country, but they also place Chile is a financially stable country that brings development opportunities that their own country does not provide for them. They hope for calm and a better quality of life.

> "My husband came here first, because one of his brothers was already here, and obviously, it's easier when you have someone helping you or a place to arrive at... so he came and then we came afterwards".

> "Because of the opportunities, the quality of life. My daughters want to keep on studying".

They arrive at Chile and, in general, they like it. They consider it a modern, orderly, country, with attractive cities and educated people. And though the weather is not really to their taste, and they find Chileans to be not really cheerful, most of them expect to live a quite future in this country. And they do not see themselves returning to their country in the near future.

"I heard people saying "Chile is something else", and my fear was to stray away from Venezuela. I would say "no, I won't go any further", but my children would say: "Mom, let's look for a place in which we feel good, in which we are at ease", but I never expected to get here... Honestly, it is a total. We've been here since January and I already feel at ease, and so do my daughters".

> "Santiago is a lot like Caracas. Like the Caracas of days gone by".

Sadly, the heat, even when it is not the heat we had the Zulia, because in here you have the polar opposites... when it's cold, it's really cold, and when there is heat, it's a scorching heat. Our weather is hot, but not scorching".

#### Documents and arrival to Chile

Arriving to Chile is not easy and most of them came with their Venezuelan ID card and some came with their passport. They know that these documents will not be of use for much longer, so most of them being the regularization process.

This a slow process, for in the case of people who came through illegal border crossing the first step is to file a self-complaint in order to get an appointment. In the case of those who came without a passport, they must get one or unblock an older one.

All of the cases in these study were at different stages of the process. A series of formalities thus begins in order to gather all the conditions needed for a definitive visa and RUT.

"The law mandates a passport, but for us the passport thing is tough, is not easy at all. If you do not have your exit papers from Venezuela and you do not have any migratory movements, asking for your passport outside Venezuela is a whole process".

"I have not been able to get into this regularization process, because at first they told me that I need to get a passport, they told me that I have to pay for the unblocking, because if I asked for my passport here or I got one here, it would come out as if I had never left Venezuela. They told me that I had to pay for a migratory unblocking. I have my hands tied behind my back, a little".

Although some know about the process, it was not easy for them to understand every step of it, as there is apparently no clear information about i ton the formal communication channels, such as consulates, embassies, departments of foreign affairs or others, so then informal channels

become relevant when the time comes to seek information or clear doubts, among other things.

The spaces they use to communicate with each other are:

- > Social networks: Venezuelan WhatsApp groups, Venezuelans in Chile Facebook pages, etc.
- > NGOs that assists migrants.
- > Jesuit communities.
- > INCAMI: Chilean Catholic Institute for Migration.

> "We have just filed the self-complaint, because when we got here in March, we tried to do it through the PDI website, in which you were supposed to ask for an appointment to make the self-complaint, but the appointment never came. So, though this group or hyperlink, whatever, form the WhatsApp group, I guess they know more about this stuff..."

> "It's a group from the NGO, which also gives us information, and it is through this group that I am here right now. So, they gave us a link that could really set the appointment, which did come and then we filed the self-complaint. In fact, we did it this past Saturday".

Some mention that given this informal situation, the information does not reach everyone, or at least not in the same manner, which also generates confusion. One of the reasons they single out is the digital gap.

> "We come from a country in which there is also an enormous digital gap. For example, not everyone has a pone nor knows how to handle social networks, and there are those who do not have this technology on their phones... And the pandemic situation has also led people to have a more restrict access to information. What my friend here is saying is true: there are people who are careless, but I'd say that most people want to be a regular, they want to have their papers up to date".

#### Lack of RUN and stay in Chile

In Chile, during the time in which they have been as irregular migrants, they have not often been asked for their national documentation. However, it is the police and other foreigners who tend to ask for their papers and RUT, and in those moments, they feel discriminated and vulnerable.

> "In the street, all the time. The police, all the time. You are sitting quietly anywhere, and they see you and come to ask for that".

Once, when I was coming out of the subway. The police was there and I was just passing through and, I don't know, they might have thought I had a Venezuelan face. I didn't even know what to say, out of fear, because I told them "No, they are going to put me on a plane to Venezuela" and I told them "I'm in the process of regularization". And they say "oh, OK".

> "Yes, because the first thing you get asked, when there are suspicious Chileans thinking "oh, this one is a foreigner", the first thing they say, "Can I see your RUT, please?".

> "When they see that you are vulnerable, that you do not have a RUT..."

> "I have felt more discrimination from the legal foreigner than from the Chileans themselves. I have seen the Peruvian and Colombian taking advantage of the vulnerability of the Venezuelan".

> "At work, they want to give me a contract and they can't do it because I don't have the papers".

The procedures for which they have needed their RUN the most are:

- > Bank account
- > Health system
- > Hiring a phone plan
- > Seeking employment
- > Sending wire transfers
- Renting a place

Until now, most of them have not needed to use any health services, they use prepaid phones, they pay overprices home renting fees when they admit that they do not have documentation, and friends lend them their bank accounts.

However, not all of them do well, as it is in these spaces of need that they live the most vulnerable situations for not having a RUN, and they rely mostly on the good will of friends, but, since they have no one else they can trust on this journey, they have been subjects of fraud without been able to do anything about it. This vulnerability is the biggest discrimination that they feel:

"Venezuelans suffer, for they have to appeal to the good will of someone, a third party... I even known people who have been defrauded as they try to trust that third party and they do not go through with the banking operations".

> "They always ask for an extra month plus the deposit, I don't know what else... we gave it to him and then it turned out that the person who signed that contract was not the owner of the place".

> "Nowadays, I think that the situation with rentals is becoming more and more frequent. I live in a room, in a sort of housing residence, and I pay 280 for just one room. All because I lack this one paper".

"No, I have not my papers yet", and it happened because this guy was already insinuating things, that I had to sleep with him, that I had to things with him, and since I did not agree to it, that very same day he pulled out this piece of information telling me that I wasn't able to file any complaint, he told me I could not hire me anymore, that my services at his house were no longer... well, his kids, when I call them and say "no, your father told me that...", they said to me "no, of course, because you are here illegally and you cannot mess with him...", I mean, they could disrespect me and because they are people with papers here I couldn't do anything".

> "What happened to us was that, when we arrived, as they had stolen everything from us, we had to start working at a fast-food place, and the girl, the owner of the place would yell at us and insults us in front of the customers. And the only thing she said was "I am helping you out, because you have no papers". There are times in which you have to take some of it, but I couldn't stand anymore of that situation. It happened twice and I left. My daughter stayed there a Little longer and I told her "come on, girl". And she would say "no, mom, because if there is a quarantine, how are we going to solve this". This is a place which is always in very

high demand, a lot of people go there, and it was 10 at night and this woman would throw her tantrums and what she would yell at my daughter was that: "You have no bothers", so the last thing she did was kick her out, blocked her on her phone and did not pay her what was due".

Finding a job without a RUT has not been easy at all, but they have managed to do so through their fellow compatriots who recommend them as they become people with their migratory status regularized:

Someone who says "I can vouch for them". At least in homes it is like that. "I can vouch for her, she won't be taking anything home...", thanks to the other person being here legally or having their papers and standing up for you".

> "In almost every job what happens is that. One friend would say "look, they are looking to hire, speak to the boss, or whomever".

This is why they seek to obtain an identification card, as they believe that upon having it, their lives will change from their current state of vulnerability, from their status as foreigners to solve their problems related to everyday life, which will bring them a better sense of welfare.

- > "You become a person. With an ID card, a RUT, you are a person here".
- > "You feel less discriminated. There is less discrimination".
- > "I will be able to rent a better place at a fair price".
- > "I will be able to enroll at Cesfam".

They do not possess much information about the Chilean identification document, they perceive it to be more modern and with more uses than the one from their country. In general, they think of Chile as a very digitalized country when it comes to paperwork, in comparison to Venezuela, and, therefore a more efficient one.

\* For example, to get your birth certificate in Venezuela, you cannot ask for it on the Internet, as you can do here. You have to go to the office of the Civil Registry in which you were registered and ask for the certificate there. In Chile, you go on the Internet and in a fraction of a second, using your ClaveÚnica, you can get your birth certificate and those of your children".

They do not know the difference in the RUN number, they only refer to it as explicitly saying "foreigner" and that is the main difference for them.

It is worth mentioning that the Chilean identification card does not show the difference, as they recognize that, in Venezuela, the foreigner' identification card is very different from the one that Venezuelans have (color, numbering).

> "I think not, I think they are in the same sequence. The thing is that the card says "Foreigner".

They do not think that this constitutes a discriminatory element in the RUT, but rather not having it generates a symbolic discrimination that exposes them to situations of abuse. Not only from some Chileans, but from other Venezuelans as well.

There are some Venezuelans here that have a RUT and think that they are... In fact, there are Venezuelans, I know this, that have been here for a while and say: "Why do you come here to f\*ck around?" The Venezuelans themselves, more than the Chileans".

#### Suggestions

In this regard, what they ask for to improve the document obtention process and the regularization of their migratory state is:

- > Greater celerity in the processes
- > Flexibility in document delivery deadlines
- > Amend the information available
- > Quicker and timely answers

> "One situation is Foreign Affairs telling you "no, you cannot present this to me. Bring me another thing, but you have 5 days to do it. Give me a longer deadline, provide me with some alternatives... Give me a chance. If you ask me for 5 days to bring you all my background papers, I won't bring them to you, because it takes a minimum of 15 days for the Venezuelan state to give them to me, as they are done online... when and if the website is not down...".

> "Amend your documentation. That documentation you sent was not the one you needed; you lost your chance... "No, let me bring you what you need".

#### Lessons

Irregular migrants have not had the best of times coming to Chile, and despite the difficulties they have gone through, they feel that they are in a country that provides them with greater stability and better future perspectives.

Regardless of this, their irregular situation makes them feel extremely vulnerable, not having a RUN exposes them to various types of abuse, which they feel to be discrimination for the mere fact of not having a RUN or the papers that would change their migratory status.

In this way, the difficulties that they face in their country and on the road extend themselves to their stay in Chile up until they receive their identification card, which will come to change their lives. In the meantime, they are subject to the slow answer times in their paperwork both in Venezuela and in Chile.

## RECRUITES EXPERIENCE

#### METHODOLOGICAL CONTEXT

This is the results report from 3 interviews with human resources management, with the purpose of inquiring on the exchanges they have with the migrant population during their hiring processes. In order to do this, we interviewed a recruitment company, a mining company and a tech-related company, the latter two being multinationals.

It is important to highlight that this is a qualitative study and does not intend to be representative, given than our is a very small simple and that these results cannot, therefore, be extrapolated to a more massive discourse.

#### RESULTS

#### Company context and inclusion

In Chile, for companies, migration is a relatively new phenomenon, so tells us the person working for a recruitment company "we have been in the market for some years now and this tendency has become massive from about a year or so".

Company recruitment processes in the companies we interviewed are internal and, in general, they go to online platforms like LinkedIn in order to socialize the position they need, and then a series of interviews is conducted. Any person aspiring to the position, including migrants, follows the same selection process.

> "We have a department of selection and hiring, so what we generally do is to post on a site. Nowadays we frequently posted in LinkedIn, we get a number of CVs that match our profile and staging area. We receive our CVs through the platform and then we send them to the specialized technical area".

In the case of multinationals there is something in particular. The exchange with and of foreign professionals is an older part of their dynamics, and it is not only part of their culture, as they are used to have a daily routine based on the interaction between people from different parts of the world, but it is also common from them to have recruitment process that are done at a global level.

The companies that we interviewed perceive that the integration of migrants to their hiring logics has been a natural and spontaneous process that takes place naturally due to the high flow of migrants. In this regard, there are no migrant hiring policies, nor a special planification of the inclusion of migrants or any other minority, it just happens. This is how all of them claim to be open to hire diverse people and do not consider that they present any discriminatory elements in their recruitment processes.

"No, we do not have any policies to that respect, for we do not discriminate, so we do not believe that is necessary to have a policy. In here, we make no differences by either gender, sexual orientation, or I don't know... country, ethnicity, religion, politics or anything. What matters to us is that people we hire have the traits we are looking for, that they are technically adequate and with a profile that is familiar to us and just like that they are in. There are no differences, we have talked about it. We have an ethics code, we work around it and we discussed the possibility of incorporating a special policy, but we ultimately decided that we will not discriminate neither positively or negatively in any case. What we are interested in is in having good professionals working with us".

"No, that is a new issue, at least the companies that work with us, from what I've gathered, they do not have a formal policy for it, other than maybe a certain disposition towards it. But it is not in their manuals or formal documents. Neither in the companies' or the clients'. There is, however, a certain practice that has not been formalized".

And though there are no hiring policies, there are integration policies within the companies that seek to favor social integration dynamics with the goal of having foreigners and nationals positively adapting to this exchange.

> "We have a direct declaration of respect, that is, we have committee for diversity and inclusion that works in all these matters from different angles, but the important thing is that inclusion is known from every angle, be it gender, race, etc, I will leave many off the list. But the important thing today is that we are designing new ways of promoting, making, removing, generating awareness, through talks with experts, so that people can learn more about it. Some very interesting debates have come about it. This is not a human resources initiative, but rather human resources is participant of a broader company definition".

Not only the idea of establishing any discrimination is frowned upon, but diversity is valued as a means to establish a competitive advantage:

> "And why should we do it? Because we believe that is a competitive advantage from an idea perspective. It generates diverse ideas, and in order to have diverse ideas, you have to have a diverse population".

However, given that this is not a structural company policy, these human resources managers did not have the data on how many foreigners work in their company or what was the employee distribution by nationality. Regarding this, they mention that they seek people that conform to a profile and if they do so, nationality is not a relevant factor of the work dynamic.

Nevertheless, there is something that can be observed in migrant recruitment, and this is their knowledge of and capacity to adapt to the national contingency.

I need them to know a lot about the local market. This person applying from Azerbaijan doesn't get it. The local section of the mining market is part of the reasons, so it is not like I had anything against people from Azerbaijan, but that I need someone who has a knowledge of the local trade and that is also valid in a recruitment process".

#### Work and migrants

From the experience of those who conduct selection processes, they do not perceive any discrimination against migrants. Furthermore, many of them are seeking to hire them:

- > From the positive aspects:
- They have a lot of experience in engineering, and this is a most valuable experience in their country of origin.
- From the negative aspects: A migrant seeks lower salaries, and therefore becomes a "cheap" worker.

"Now, what I have found is that many companies take advantage from this situation because these folks ask for very low salaries. For instance, one of our B engineers makes about \$2,300,000 or \$2,500,000 and the times I've had to interview a migrant individual, they ask for something kike 700 thousand pesos to 1 million".

> "There are other companies that, once they found the technical profile, they seek the cheapest possible worker"

It is worth mentioning that the companies we interviewed had a profile of professional and technical workers, and as such their most common link is with the Venezuelan migrants, as they have this sort of education (something that does not happen with other nationalities that have a high migrant population in Chile).

Many technical and professional capabilities of Venezuelan workers are appreciated, but also their soft skills are also highly valued. Amongst the attributes that are highlighted of these professionals we can find:

- > Expertise in their area.
- > A different perspective on the local reality.
- > Good technical and professional formation.
- > Good disposition.
- > Dedication to the task, collaborative efforts.
- > Dedication towards the client, kindness.
- Commitment.
- > Thankful for their benefits.
- > Look after their jobs.

> "They are incredibly dedicated to the tasks you give them. They are committed to the company, they have a better commitment than what I gather from Chilean workers. I obviously cannot make a general statement, but these Venezuelan folks that work with us are tough cookies. When we have to go on location and spend the weekend there because there is an emergency, they are the first to raise their hand and go there. They look after their job, that is, they are committed to the company and are so thankful over every little thing, that, I don't know, we are a fairly good company, we offer a lot of benefits, I don't know, we give meal vouchers and they are very happy to have a meal voucher".

> "In terms of competence, they are very well prepared, they know a lot, particularly in the area that we cover, which is 23:53, because they were the 23:53 pioneers, as oil pipelines and gas pipelines were built in

Venezuela way before than in Chile, so they know the construction norms and calculation upside down. They were a tremendous contribution to us and an element of experience for every team they joined".

"In migrant individuals, it depends on the roles, as there maybe is some complexity as there is even a certain preference from our clients in hiring migrants, there are some that say, for instance, I'm looking for Venezuelans, for they say that they have a different attitude towards work. This applies to both skilled position and unskilled ones"

> "I'd say that the main thing is that they have a different perspective on things, because the other position is to standardize, depending on the country they come from. They can be quicker in doing some things, they may have more knowledge, they can do things tidier, be more kind when providing a better service to the client".

The disadvantages of establish a link to foreigners have to do with their documentation processes and it is recognized to be more difficult alongside:

- > Obtaining/Renewing an identity document.
- > Professional title validation.
- More specific difficulties for people who have more than one nationality or have difficulties in the order of theirs last names.

> "Now we are asking for a different filter because our clients are asking us for people who have their title validated in n Chile. Hence, now people must have their title validated. Having it officially stamped is no longer enough, they have to be officially validated as an engineer, given the responsibility that the calculations and projects that we are building entail".

In general, slow processes are taking into consideration, as they demand a time that limits some of the migrants' activities in the work environment.

- > For example, there are people who work on-site and cannot enter certain places if they do not have a ID card.
- There are difficulties when payday comes, because not having an ID card prevents them from opening a bank account.

> "What has happened to us is that the Venezuelans we have hired here in Chile have their migratory status regularized. They are in the temporary visa stage, so we offer them a work contract, and they move to the definitive stage. This, however, takes a very long time. I don't know why it takes so long. This is a problem for us when we have to present our credentials, when our personnel goes on-site, they have to go with a valid, not expired, RUT, so that is a very complex situation for us, but we hire them nonetheless and we are patient and wait for a solution to their issues to come".

These, however, are situations that can be sorted out temporarily and they decide to wait for the paperwork of their workers, that they selected because of their skills, to be up to date.

> "When they have the most basic documentation there are some chances to have a bank account, because they need a place in which to receive deposits. People solve them, temporarily, by providing the data from a third person's bank account".
#### Migrant work and documentation

Companies do not hire personnel that are irregular migrants, given the risks it entails for them to do something that may be against the law. In general, there have been no greater difficulties associated to the documentation of the migrants workers currently working with them.

> "When facing an irregular situation, the company is exposed to fines if it hires people who are irregulars. Then, someone with bad intentions may call upon the national work inspection so that they audit me and then... we, as providers for the mining sector have to have a spotless record, and therefore cannot run any risks".

> "We have not wanted to run that risk, maybe we did it at first and in a circumstantial manner, but we cannot do it today, as it may jeopardize the activity of the companies themselves".

The most frequent scenario is that of Venezuelan migrants that have an expired temporary identification card, but this situation does not pose much of a difficulty for companies, as they can offer contracts with a RUN number despite the ID card being expired. Once the contract is offered, the migrant can begin the process of obtaining a definitive RUT.

The process of obtaining the RUT is considered to be:

- Slow, they have had some experiences of people waiting for 3 months (in the context of a global pandemic).
- "Undignified" in the sense of the long waiting lines and the poor quality of customer service that is perceived in this process.
- > Messy, does not have a proper flow, papers get lost, etc.

Companies claim that they are trying to help in this process so that their workers do not find stressing elements that have nothing to do their jobs and can thus properly focus on it. They even mention that they have helped them to bring their families from other countries, so that their employees can enjoy a better quality of life.

Nevertheless, there is an interesting example on the lengths that a company is or not willing to go in terms of migratory paperwork. One of the companies we interviewed brings employees from the Philippines, as their owner is Filipino, and he conducts this practice as a form of altruism towards his native country and the wellbeing of its citizens. However, the process is very complex when it is the company that has to conduct the entire procedure. In fact, they tell it as a terrible experience:

The one thing we have done is for these kids that come from the Philippines, with whom we do all the paperwork from scratch. The experience is not really good, as is very time-consuming, too much so. It's unconceivable that they are able to travel... without even having a RUT... that they can travel with their passports for three months and then we have to input all of the papers in the migration system once more, which is a cost for us, as it is usually done by an attorney, as the internal capacity of my team is not enough. We pay our corporate attorney to do all this paperwork and it tales, I don't know... four more months. I don't know what would happen should the papers get lost, but, for example, this one time, the last time we brought some folks, one of them didn't get a RUT, as if the papers had been scrambled along the way, they didn't know where they were, and we had to stop all over again, which meant that all of the documents had

to be sent in again from the Philippines. So... it seems to me like the system is disorganized, bad, negligent. They do not empathize with the people who are going through the paperwork and that want to be here as regular immigrants. It is as if they set out to make their lives miserable, I think. It was an awful experience. For us, the companies that do not make any distinctions, it really is a problem".

What is interesting from this experience is to verify that when processes become complex, those who hire reduce their willingness to keep hiring. An aspect that, fortunately, is not currently happening.

The RUT is recognized as a document that for all foreigners has a different RUN number, a difference that all have spontaneously noticed, though it is not a filter in their processes. In fact, the number is understood as being "that of a newborn" in our country, hence the corresponding numbering.

"Of course, if someone is over 20 and the RUT has a number over the 20-million mark, this is a foreigner.
 We have internalized that aspect, but it has no relevance in our processes. It's not like we use it as a filter".

Besides, they consider that this number is identifiable, and even though it is not a discriminating element, it may lead to situation that favor discrimination, especially when it comes to hiring.

> "I believe so, I believe that the high number RUT as a clear mark of being a foreigner may influence the decisions of certain people".

"I do believe it, yes. I believe that there should not be a different RUT, I mean, why do they have to make this difference?... It is like placing a sticker on top of of it when you have a different RUT. It is like printing "I'm not Chilean", and what for?... I mean... I don't know. I feel that Chile is a racist country, many people do reject migrants".

In spite of this, the RUN is not a discriminatory element according to their experience. To the contrary, obtaining a RUT/RUN only favors the migrant workers, both in and out of the workplace logic.

#### Suggestions

For the integration of migrant people in the workplace dynamics to be empowered by private corporations, the following suggestions were made:

Promote the logic of referrals between migrants:

> "We are thinking of a referral system, that is, we want them to refer to us profiles of migrants, or other profiles as well. This program would mean that I somehow reward those who take their time or make an effort provide us with data of third parties that comply with the profile we are seeking. And those who refer receive some sort of prize".

36

Promote the characteristics of value that the migrant has:

"It could be a bet, a bet on knowledge, on experience, on providing the example of idiosyncrasies that have certain things that we lack. In some nationalities, they have a better disposition towards the client and this applies to very professional sectors as well as in the administrative ones, and we all know that... I mean, we may all have the smarts, but this disposition, this orientation towards the client can be a competitive advantage that we, given our idiosyncrasy, origin or whatever, just don't have".

In terms of public logic, they expect the State to take measures in order to make these processes more efficient:

- > Make the migratory process orderly.
- > Quick and easy access to temporary documentation.
- > Dignified and friendly service.
- > Employment agency: one that connects the companies with who they need.
- > Dedicate more resources to the migratory issue.
- > Clearer information on the processes that migrants must follow..
- > Make the validation of professional titles easier, particularly in those fields in which there is a lack of professionals.
- Do not set quotas on migrant hiring but put in practice an audit system that prevents abuse.
- > Digitalization of migratory processes.

#### Lessons

- The mass migration phenomenon is relatively new in Chile, and, in this regard, the possibilities associated with it are also new. In general, those migrants that came longer ago are workers with no formal training. The new migration wave has more professional training, and therefore we can find migrant workers at all corporate levels.
- Currently there is no, at least in the social discourse, discriminatory elements in the RUN or elsewhere that creates or favors discriminatory logics in the workplace, at least in the personnel recruitment processes. It is worth mentioning that the Venezuelan diaspora has had their professional and technical skills valued as such.

#### 38

## EXPERIMENT: HOW DOES THE RUN NUMBER AFFECT THE MIGRANTS' ACCESS TO WORK?

Aiming to complement the qualitative work undertaken on field and remotely with migrants and people with interests in the migratory process, such as the people who hire them, we conducted an econometric exercise to measure whether having a foreigner's RUN would affect the chances of finding a job through a proxy that is the answer to an e-mail that has a CV responding to a real job offer.

We generated an experiment to explore whether there is discrimination in the job marketplace associated with the RUN that is given to migrant citizens.

The experiment was based in the creation of a database of fictional people, with variations in their most important characteristics for their selection in the job market, such as: education, experience, age, sex, socioeconomical characteristics, amongst others. This information -although random- allows to differentiate between a migrant (treatment group) from a Chilean individual (control group) only through their RUN. In parallel, we created CVs that would be sent to real job offerings in the trade and services sector. With all of this, we gathered information on the interactions (answers to the application e-mails) that would allow us to conduct causal effect studies utilizing the methodologies of the linear regression<sup>43</sup>, logit<sup>44</sup> and multinomial logit<sup>45</sup> models.

#### Sample size

In order to decide the size of our experiment's simple, it was necessary to consider that, in the first place, it is optimal for half of the sample to receive the treatment (treatment group, in this case, having a foreign RUN) and the other half has to be the control group.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> A linear regression is a statistical method used to model the relationship between two scalar variables and another variable, one of which is the variable to be explained (in this case, the number of answers received) and the other being the explicatory, in this case whether or not the person has migrant or local RUN.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Logit is a statistical method used to model the relationship between one variable (scalar or otherwise) and another one that goes between 0 and 1, which can be read as a probability.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> The multinomial logit method takes a series of categories as a variable to be explained, which is used to explain the probability of different possible scenarios.

In the second place, it is important to consider the statistical limitations that are detailed in Annex 1 and, finally, the size of our sample depends on how precise we may want to be. In all cases, we accept a minimum detectable affect equal to 25 % of  $\sigma$  and we make type I<sup>46</sup> mistakes with a 5% probability. However:

If N=395, we have an 80% success probability by rejecting that there is no effect (for there is, in fact, effect in the treatment) and we have a 5 % probability of making a type I mistake.

If N=548, we have a 90% success probability by rejecting that there is no effect (for there is, in fact, effect in the treatment) and we have a 5 % probability of making a type I mistake.

If N=692, we have 95% success probability by rejecting that there is no effect (for there is, in fact, effect in the treatment) and we have a 5 % probability of making a type I mistake.

If N=1698, we have a 99% success probability by rejecting that there is no effect (for there is, in fact, effect in the treatment) and we have a 1% probability of making a type I mistake.

In our case, given the logistical limitations of our study, we will accept conditions closer to the first and we will take a sample of N=400 individuals.

#### Database structure

Once N is decided, the next step is to design the database structure that would allow us to conduct the final analysis. In this regard, the different variables generated for each individual are:

1. Commune and address: Although the population of interest is mostly located in Santiago, Recoleta, Independencia, Estación Central and San Joaquin<sup>47</sup>, our objective is for the only way of an individual to be identified as a migrant to be through their RUN. Besides, each commune is associated with their Social Protection Index (IPS) from 2020, which would act as proxy for socioeconomical characterization.

2. Unique identifier: In order to identify each individual in order to make them interact with the rest of the database.

3. Age and Sex: They allow to control through relevant variables at the time of participating in an application process.

4. Personal Information: The most common and necessary in order to apply for a job: Names, Last Names, RUN, contact method (e-mail) and date of birth.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> A type I mistake is when the null hypothesis is rejected (when there is no statistically significant relationship between the explicatory variant and the dependent variable) when it is actually true (there is no significant effect).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>Central communes in Santiago, with a marked migrant presence.

6. Education and work experience: All the individuals in our sample have completed the 12 basic years of education (full high school), but some of them have a generic unspecified type of higher learning. All of them have work experience (even when they do not, it is mentioned). Experience provides the total of years they have been employed, how many times they have been employed (up to a maximum of five times) and for how long did they stay in that job (including intervals of years that are coherent with their age and education).

#### Sending the curriculum

The experiment can be thus simplified: N is the number of people in the sample, and E corresponds to the amount of job offers/employers available to send CVs<sup>48</sup>.

We define M as the amount of people that use the same e-mail. Thus, C=N/M will be the amount of unique e-mail addresses to be created (if M=1 each person has their own unique e-mail address and therefore we have to create N addresses) y we will define E/M as the number of applications that each person submits. Finally, the number of applications that is received and to be evaluated by each employer will equal M (they will receive as many different applications as there are different e-mail address).

Our intention was to have each individual apply to 10 offers, that is, E/M=10 or rather, M=E/10. Thus, we would pre-define the amount of people that would share the same e-mail address, and therefore we would have defined C=N/M, that is, the amount of unique e-mail addresses to be created.

By using this algorithm, the input will be E and the output N/M, the amount of unique e-mail addresses and also the assignation of each individual to an address.

As an example, let us say we have an N=600 sample and E=50 available jobs. In order to have each individual apply to 10 jobs, we would have M=50/10=5 of people sharing an e-mail, and we would have to create C=500/5=100 unique e-mail addresses in order to achieve our goal. Out of the 5 individuals sharing each e-mail address, the first one will apply to jobs [1-10], the second to [11-20], the third to [21-30], the fourth one to [31-40] and the fifth one to [41-50]. With that, each individual of the sample will have one e-mail address and 10 jobs to apply to associated to them.

The final sending was done using 20 e-mail addresses, from which each employer (E=200) received 20 different e-mails. This allowed for each one of the 400 individuals to apply to 10 jobs. In this way, we can have an intensive and extensive response variable (how many times they were called for an interview<sup>49</sup> and whether they were contacted at least once<sup>50</sup>).

40

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> It is worth mentioning that this methodology was used to make the experiment more efficient. For example, generating different e-mail address that would seem viable is a very time-consuming task which we attempted to minimize by using the same e-mail address for several of the fictional CVs.
<sup>49</sup> Which may go from 1 to 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> R is an open-source computer language and program used for statistical analysis.

#### CV creation

All of the controls are random and allow us to capture an interesting variance that allows to better isolate the effect of treatment (having a migrant RUN). For the creation of curriculums, we used the database that has all of the information, and a program was created using R<sup>51</sup> software.

The program turns all of the tabulated characteristics of the curriculum into objects and then defines a template that distributes these attributes in documents with different formats. In this way, it is possible to automatize the creation of the 400 curriculums.

#### Descriptive statistics

The experiment is based on sending an e-mail applying to a job and obtaining an answer up to 1 month after. In mathematical terms, a variable is generated, it will take a value of 0 when there was no answer and of 1 when there was. Additionally, an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job is required.

For the multinomial logit model, answers are classified depending on what the employee may (or may not) write in the answer. Thus, the codification used was:

0	=	There was no answer at all.
1	=	Interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job is
		requested.
2	=	Another candidate was already selected for the job.

- 3 = Offer expired or is no longer available for different motives.
- 4 = Information error upon sending / no such e-mail /information amendment / curriculum request.
- 5 = Confirmation of e-mail received.

The idea was for jobs not to have major restrictions and that anyone (man or woman) between 25 and 35 could apply. In this way, we created an environment in which the treatment (having a migrant RUN) was a variable that allowed us to make a distinction.

In the "jobs to apply to" category we considered: waiter/waitress, uncertified security guard, production operators, warehouse operators, cash registry operators, assistants, etc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup>R is an open-source computer language and program used for statistical analysis.

Figure 1 (subfigure A and B): Behavior of answers by company



(A) Distribution of the number of responses per CV





Figure 1 contains the information associated to the positive answers from companies. Subfigure (a) shows the distribution of positive answers (called to an interview). We can notice than over 80 out of the 200 companies did not respond positively to any applicant and that almost 40 companies gave positive answers to 1 or 2 applicants of the 20 that each one received.

On the other hand, subfigure (b) shows us the number of positive answers that each of the 200 companies gave, with 20 being the maximum, that is, they answered positively to all applicants.





Figure 2 illustrates the heterogeneity of positivity that the type of CV had. It was expected that each template or style had different positivity, as there are curriculums that are more or less neat than others. In this sense, when we conduct our causal analysis, it will be necessary to control for this variable, as it offers a source of variability.



#### Figure 3: Distribution of positive answers by treatment

Figure 3 shows the amount of people who received between 0 and 6 positive answers, this is what we call the intensive margin of answers. This metric will be useful as it offers another causality dimension since each individual applied to 10 different jobs. This allowed us to explore whether someone is getting more or less positive answers from having a different RUN.

Figure 4: Distribution of type of response by RUN



Figure 4 explores the type of response, coded as it was previously described. We can notice that, in the codes with the most answers (0 and 1) there is no noticeable difference between the amount of people with a migrant or native RUN migrant. However, migrants did not receive, unlike natives, type 2 answers (another candidate was already selected for the job) or type 3 (the offer expired or is no longer valid for different motives).



#### Figure 5: Distribution of the type of response by quartile

Figure 5 allows us to explore the socioeconomical dimension of the answers. Since every individual had a commune of residence associated to them, what we did was use the Social Protection Index (2020) in order to conduct a socioeconomic characterization of each commune. Thus, in figure 6 we use the IPS quartile in which 1 is the least vulnerable (of less social priority) quartile and 4 is the most vulnerable (of higher social priority) quartile. We can notice two interesting facts: (i) the greatest differences do not take place in the extremes, but between quartiles 2 and 3; and (ii) the extremes behave in the same manner in answers 0 and 1.



Figure 6: Distribution of type of answer by sex

Figure 6 follows the same line of the previous figures, seeing the type of answer that was given, differentiated by sex. In this sense, we can notice that, in general, there was a greater response in men than in women.



#### Figure 7: Distribution of answers by age

Figure 8: Distribution of answer by age and treatment



Figure 7 uses the dichotomic variable (positive if coding value is 1 and negative for all the rest) in order to characterize the results of the experiment by age. We do not appreciate an evident pattern. However, figure 8 does the same one, but distinguishing according to the treatment. It can be appreciated that, although very slight, there is a tendency to give a positive answer to migrant people when they are younger, and to natives when they are closer to 35 years old.



#### Figure 9: Distribution of answers by communal positivity

Finally, figure 9 accounts for communal positivity. This index was built taking the number of positive answers that each commune received, divided by the total amount of applications that were submitted by individuals residing in that commune. In this way, for example, the Providencia circumference indicates that: the commune of Providencia, which belongs to quartile 1 (least vulnerable), received a positive answer to 20% of its applications and it is also over its quartile's average, which is close to 15%.

Bearing this in mind, it is possible to observe that positivity seems to increase as the commune becomes more vulnerable, but it falls down on the extreme.

#### **ECONOMETRIC RESULTS**

Given the nature of the experiment, the estimation was made using: (1) a simple linear regression model (also called ordinary least squares); (2) logit for dichotomic variables (reception or request for interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job of any of the other options) (table 1); a categorical multinomial logit model (3) to estimate the way in which the treatment affects the probability of being in one of the following situations (table 2):

0	=	There was no answer at all.
1	=	Interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job is requested.
2	=	Another candidate was already selected for the job.
3	=	Offer expired or is no longer available for different motives.
4	=	Information error upon sending/no such e-mail /information amendment /curriculum request.
5	=	Confirmation of e-mail received.

Additionally, we studied the effect on the intensity of the effect (how many positive answers were received with 6 being the largest number) by using ordinal multinominal logit (5) (from 0 to 6, table 3).

# Tabla 1. Ordinary least squares and logit results in the probability of being contacted for an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job.

	-0.00457	-0.0313	-0.0144	-0.00163	-0.00696	-0.393	-0.0203	-0.0613
TREATMENT	[-0.0299,0.0207]	[-0.199,0.136]	[-0.220,0.249]	[-0.0350,0.0317]	[-0.0422,0.0283]	[-1.227,2.013]	[-0.238,0.197]	[-0.294,0.172]
MUNICIPALITY	0.0000734 [-0.000507,0.000653]	0.000546 [-0.00330,0.00439]				0.000512 [-0.00333,0,0.00453]	0.000536 [0.00331,0.00438]	0.000584 [0.00327,0.00444]
AGE	0.00418 [-0.0109,0.0193]	0.0268 [-0.0754,0.129]	0.0000780 [0.00543,0.00558]			0.0350 [-0.0727,0.143]	0.0269 [-0.0753,0.129]	0.0254 [-0.0768,0.128]
GENDER	-0.0369'' [-0.0618,-0.0120]	-0.251'' [-0.421,-0.0820]		-0.0368' [-0.0709,-0.00271]		-0.255** [-0.427,-0.0843]	-0.238* [-0.476,-0.000528]	-0.252** [-0.421,-0.0825]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.0320 [-0.100,-0.0361]	-0.206 [-0.674,-0.262]			-0.0288 [-0.0631,0.00555]	-0.208 [-0.675,-0.259]	-0.207 [-0.675,-0.261]	-0.232 [-0.725,-0.262]
TOTAL LABOUR EXPERIENCE	-0.00435 [-0.0243,0.0156]	-0.0277 [-0.160,0.105]				-0.0301 [-0.163,0.103]	-0.0284 [-0.162,0.105]	-0.0269 [-0.159,0.106]
QUANTITY OF EXPERIENCES	-0.00173 [-0.0180,0.0146]	-0.0121 [-0.120,0.0959]				-0.0126 [-0.120,0.0953]	-0.0123 [-0.120,0.0957]	-0.0117 [-0.120,0.0963]
DURATION OF THE FIRST EXPERIENCE	-0.00307 [0.0188,0.0127]	-0.0224 [0.124,0.0794]				-0.0210 [-0.123,0.0808]	-0.0220 [-0.124,0.0800]	-0.0222 [-0.124,0.0796]
DURATION OF THE SECOND EXPERIENCE	0.00315 [0.0121,0.0184]	0.0205 [0.078,0.0119]				0.0220 [-0.0763,0.0120]	0.0211 [-0.0776,0.120]	0.0211 [-0.0773,0.119]
DURATION OF THE THIRD EXPERIENCE	0.00359 [-0.0120,0.0192]	0.0247 [-0.0750,0.124]				0.0262 [-0.0735,0.126]	0.0251 [-0.0748,0.125]	0.0250 [-0.0747,0.125]
DURATION OF THE FOURTH EXPERIENCE	0.00476 [-0.0141,0.0236]	0.0325 [0.0887,0.154]				0.0339 [-0.0873,0.155]	0.0331 [-0.0885,0.155]	0.0250 [-0.0886,0.154]
AGE			-0.000460 [-0.00817,0.00725]			-0.0141 [-0.0675,0.0394]		
GENDER							-0.0275 [-0.368,0313]	
UNIVERSITY					0.0130 [-0.0355,0.0615]			0.0614 [-0.272,0.395]
CONSTANT	0.191 [-0.121,0.503]	-1.488 [-3.583,0.607]	0.185* [0.0164,0.353]	0.205 <sup>***</sup> [0.180,0.230]	0.202 <sup></sup> [0.177,0.228]	-1.713 [-3.999,0.572]	-1.492 [-3.586,0.602]	-1447 [-3.550,0.656]
METHOD CVS CONTROL N	OLS SÍ 4000	LOGIT SÍ 4000	OLS NO 4000	OLS NO 4000	OLS NO 4000	LOGIT SÍ 4000	LOGIT SÍ 4000	LOGIT SÍ 4000

Table 1 shows the results of the regression with dependent variable of having or not received at least one interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job (at least one code 1).

The first columns show the same model, only calculated with different methods (ordinary least squares, or logit). From column 1 to 8, we can see the effect of certain variables and their interactions with different specifications (variables used in the specific model).

In the dichotomic variable of having been called at least once to an interview, for example, in columns 3, 4 y 5, it can be observed that variables of experience and education (column 3) are omitted, and that no observable variable is statistically significant so as to affect having being hired for a job.

When observing the different specification, the only significant effect is that being a woman negatively affects the chances of being called for a job. The treatment has no statistically significant relation with the curriculum being called for an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job.

#### Table 2. Multinomial logit results for the probability of being in one of the six categories

> 1

2

TREATMENT

TREATMENT	0.0 [0.0]	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]
MUNICIPALITY	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]
AGE	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]
GENDER			
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO			
TOTAL LABOUR EXPERIENCE			
QUANTITY OF EXPERIENCES			
DURATION OF THE FIRST EXPERIENCE			
DURATION OF THE SECOND EXPERIENCE			
DURATION OF THE THIRD EXPERIENCE			
DURATION OF THE FOURTH EXPERIENCE			
AGE	0.0 [0,0]		
GENDER		0.0 [0,0]	
UNIVERSITY			0.0 [0,0]
CONSTANT	0.0 [0.0]	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]

MUNICIPALITY			
AGE	-0.0659* [-0.112,-0.0202]	-0.0390* [-0.0707,-0.00731]	-0.0394* [-0.0711,-0.00771]
GENDER	-0.0262 [-0.227,0.175]	0.136 [-0.150,0.422]	-0.0499 [-0.251,0.151]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	0.0979 [-0.101,0.297]	0.109 [-0.0898,0.307]	-0.343* [-0.0898,0.307]
AGE	0.0564 [-0.00676,0.120]		
GENDER		-0.354 [-0.752,0.0446]	
UNIVERSITY			0.874 <sup>***</sup> [0.475,1.274]
CONSTANT	2.065" [0.674,3.456]	1.150° [0.182,2.118]	1.518'' [0.535,2.501]
TREATMENT	-2.029* [-3.855,-0.202]	0.345** [0.0829,0.607]	-0.0573 [-0.333,0.218]
MUNICIPALITY			
AGE	-0.0200 [-0.0628,0.0228]	0.00876 [-0.0213,0.0388]	0.0135 [-0.0164,0.0433]
GENDER	-0.358 <sup>***</sup> [-0.548,-0.168]	0.00178 [-0.264,0.267]	-0.378*** [-0.567,-0.188]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.0343 [-0.221,0.153]	-0.0176 [-0.205,0.170]	-0.0666 [-0.333,0.200]
AGE	0.0664" [0.00657,0.126]		
GENDER		-0.777 [-1.156,-0.397]	
UNIVERSITY			0.0807 [-0.295,0.457]
CONSTANT	1.253 [-0.0567,2.563]	0.173 [-0.751,1.097]	0.261 [-0.671,1.193]

-1.599 [-3.516,0.319] 0.288° [0.00373,0.573] -0.375° [-0.671,-0.0788]

\*p < 0;05, \*\*p < 0;01, \*\*\*p < 0;001

REATMENT	-1.933 [-3.897,0.0312]	-0.237 [-0.510,0.0351]	-0.196 [-0.480,0.0878]		TREATMENT	6.947" [0.958,12.93]	1.017** [0.271,1.764]	-0.277 [-0.938,0.383]
MUNICIPALITY				_	MUNICIPALITY			
AGE	-0.0327 [-0.0783,0.0130]	-0.00140 [-0.0337,0.0309]	-0.00340 [-0.0356,0.0288]	_	AGE	0.159 [-0.00663,0.324]	0.00354 [-0.0751,0.0822]	-0.00197 [-0.0818,0.0778]
GENDER	-0.626*** [-0.833,-0.418]	-0.792 [-1.080,-0.503]	-0.643 [-0.849,-0.436]	-	GENDER	-0.306 [-0.810,0.198]	-0.173 [-1.078,0.733]	-0.292 [-0.794,0.210]
INIVERSITY DUCATION = YES, 0 = NO	-0.436*** [-0.638,-0.234]	-0.434*** [-0.636,-0.232]	-0.439''' [-0.721,-0.156]	-	UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.381 [-0.877,0.116]	-0.386 [-0.883,0.110]	-16.38 [-1319.8,1287.0]
GE	0.0585 [-0.00601,0.123]			-	AGE	-0.195* [-0.385,-0.00488]		
ENDER		0.338 [-0.0716,0.747]		-	GENDER		-0.219 [-1.306,0.868]	
NIVERSITY			-0.00998 [-0.418,0.398]	< >	UNIVERSITY			16.91 [-1286.5,1320.3]
ONSTANT	1.675 <sup>-</sup> [0.281,3.069]	0.760 [-0.227,1.747]	0.811 [-0.188,1.810]	35	CONSTANT	-7.538'' [-12.83,-2.247]	-2.741" [-5.185,-0.298]	-1.795 [-4.272,0.683]
REATMENT	1.761 [-0.709,4.232]	0.00107 [-0.317,0.320]	-0.784 <sup></sup> [-1.144,-0.424]	_ 4 6	TREATMENT	16.62 [-18940.1,18973.3]	17.23 [-3736.3,3770.8]	16.46 [-3004.4,3037.4]
NUNICIPALITY				<pre>- + 0 &lt; &gt;</pre>	MUNICIPALITY			
GE	0.0259 [-0.0308,0.0826]	-0.00839 [-0.0491,0.0323]	-0.00730 [-0.0480,0.0334]	-	AGE	0.0374 [-616.3,616.4]	-0.00877 [-0.207,0.189]	-0.00687 [-0.205,0.191]
ENDER	-1.121*** [-1.398,-0.844]	-0.776 [-1.135,-0.416]	-1.108*** [-1.384,-0.831]	-	GENDER	-15.90 [-1979.0,1947.2]	-0.213 [-5340.4,5340.0]	-15.03 [-1280.5,1250.4]
INIVERSITY DUCATION = YES, 0 = NO	-0.291" [-0.545,-0.0379]	-0.291' [-0.544,-0.0371]	-0.805 [-1.159,-0.450]	-	UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-16.13 [-1972.6,1940.3]	-16.06 [-1925.7,1893.6]	-0.309 [-4162.0,4161.4]
GE	-0.0678 [-0.149,0.0138]			-	AGE	-0.0287 [-616.4,616.3]		
GENDER		-0.752'' [-1.324,-0.181]		_	GENDER		-17.44 [-6918.4,6883.6]	
INIVERSITY			1.066 <sup>***</sup> [0.554,1.577]	_	UNIVERSITY			-16.53 [-5181.7,5148.6]
ONSTANT	-0.757 [-2.500,0.985]	0.134 [-1.107,1.375]	0.495 [-0.760,1.750]	_	CONSTANT	-19.14 [-18975.9,18937.6]	-19.17 [-3772.7,3734.4]	-18.61 [-3039.5,3002.3]
o≤0;05, **p≤0;0	1			_	METHOD CVS CONTROL N	MLOGIT NO 4000	MLOGIT NO 4000	MLOGIT NO 4000

\*p < 0;05, \*\*p < 0;01, \*\*\*p < 0;001

Table 2 shows the multinomial logit results on the probability of being within one of the six categories. We focused on quadrant 1, so as not to prolong the analysis, as under three specifications this sample is affected by the probability that said CV is asked for an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job.

Under the second specification (which does not include age and interaction with the treatment), it is shown that, indeed, the treatment increases the chances of being contacted for an interview. However, this result does not seem to be robust, for if we take this first interaction from the model (which only takes the value of 1 when the person is from the treatment group and a woman), adding the interaction of having attended college and the treatment (which only takes the value of 1 when the person is from the treatment group and also has higher education) the effect is negative. However, in both cases, this relationship is statistically significant only up to 90%.

51

### Table 3. Ordinal logit results for the probability of receiving a certain number of answers

TREATMENT	0.0	0.0	0.0
	[0,0]	[0,0]	[0,0]
MUNICIPALITY	0.0	0.0	0.0
	[0,0]	[0,0]	[0.0]
AGE	0.0	0.0	0.0
	[0.0]	[0,0]	[0.0]
GENDER	0.0	0.0	0.0
	[0,0]	[0,0]	[0.0]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]	0.0 [0,0]
AGE	0.0 [0.0]		
GENDER		0.0 [0.0]	
UNIVERSITY			0.0 [0.0]
CONSTANT	0.0	0.0	0.0
	[0.0]	[0.0]	[0.0]
TREATMENT	0.349	-0.00673	-0.0816
	[-1.213,1.910]	[-0.214,0.201]	[-0.307,0.143]
MUNICIPALITY	-0.000414	-0.000383	-0.000299
	[-0.00419,0.00336]	[-0.00416,0.00339]	[-0.00408,0.00348]
AGE	0.0438	0.0364	0.0341
	[-0.0579,0.145]	[-0.0600,0.133]	[-0.0623,0.131]
GENDER	-0.278''	-0.248	-0.276**
	[-0.445,-0.112]	[-0.478,-0.0171]	[-0.442,-0.109]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.289 [-0.729,0.151]	-0.287 [-0.727,0.154]	-0.330 [-0.792,0.132]
DURACIÓN TOTAL	-0.0327	-0.0320	-0.0297
DE LA EXPERIENCIA	[-0.126,0.0607]	[-0.125,0.0613]	[-0.123,0.0635]
AGE	-0.0125 [-0.0639,0.0389]		
GENDER		-0.0554 [-0.387,0.277]	
UNIVERSITY			0.106 [-0.216,0.428]
CONSTANT	-2.118*	-1.916*	-1.840
	[-4.225,-0.0114]	[-3.822,-0.0105]	[-3.750,0.0701]
TREATMENT	5.671	16.00	-0.390
	[-44446.9,44458.3]	[-5725.6,5757.6]	[-11570.8,11570.0]
MUNICIPALITY	0.0702	0.0702	0.0702
	[-0.109,0.250]	[-0.109,0.250]	[-0.109,0.250]
AGE	0.394	0.697	0.696
	[-1445.3,1446.1]	[-1.963,3.358]	[-1.965,3.357]
GENDER	-15.18	-0.331	-14.87
	[-3612.0,3581.7]	[-9073.5,9072.9]	[-3092.9,3063.1]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	13.83 [-3707.4,3735.1]	13.57 [-3266.2,3293.4]	-1.434 [-10903.3,10900.4]
DURACIÓN TOTAL	-0.344	-0.344	-0.343
DE LA EXPERIENCIA	[-2.804,2.116]	[-2.804,2.115]	[-2.803,2.116]
AGE	0.301 [-1445.4,1446.0]		
GENDER		-16.14 [-11357.8,11325.5]	
UNIVERSITY			16.89 [-13690.6,13724.4]
CONSTANT	-48.86	-58.99	-44.46
	[-44656.9,44559.2]	[-6671.6,6553.6]	[-8096.3,8007.4]

	4.345	16.44	15.74
TREATMENT	[-32968.1,32976.8]	[-5241.8,5274.7]	[-5754.1,5785.6]
MUNICIPALITY	0.0629 [-0.0572,0.183]	0.0629 [-0.0572,0.183]	0.0630 [-0.0571,0.183]
AGE	0.809 [-1072.2,1073.8]	1.156 [-1.227,3.540]	1.156 [-1.228,3.539]
GENDER	-15.43 [-2885.7,2854.9]	-0.267 [-8414.1,8413.5]	-16.03 [-3891.4,3859.4]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-3.112 [-13.52,7.296]	-3.113 [-13.52,7.292]	-3.115 [-7588.3,7582.1]
DURACIÓN TOTAL DE LA EXPERIENCIA	-0.756 [-2.928,1.416]	-0.756 [-2.927,1.415]	-0.755 [-2.926,1.416]
AGE	0.345 [-1072.6,1073.3]		
GENDER		-16.72 [-10460.0,10426.6]	
UNIVERSITY			0.0233 [-7585.2,7585.2]
CONSTANT	-41.19 [-33013.6,32931.3]	-53.34 [-5311.8,5205.1]	-52.65 [-5822.8,5717.5]
TREATMENT	1.599 [-1.794,4.992]	0.0804 [-0.368,0.529]	-0.244 [-0.724,0.236]
MUNICIPALITY	-0.00714 [-0.0150,0.000737]	-0.00704 [-0.0149,0.000848]	-0.00661 [-0.0145,0.00128]
AGE	0.0233 [-0.194,0.241]	-0.00748 [-0.215,0.200]	-0.0181 [-0.225,0.189]
GENDER	-0.234 [-0.592,0.124]	-0.125 [-0.619,0.368]	-0.223 [-0.580,0.133]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.0669 [-1.003,0.869]	-0.0579 [-0.999,0.884]	-0.272 [-1.257,0.713]
DURACIÓN TOTAL DE LA EXPERIENCIA	0.0278 [-0.172,0.228]	0.0306 [-0.171,0.232]	-0.343 [-0.159,0.242]
AGE	-0.0525 [-0.164,0.0585]		
GENDER		-0.194 [-0.910,0.521]	
UNIVERSITY			0.519 [-0.175,1.213]
CONSTANT	-3.606 [-8.121,0.909]	-2.750 [-6.838,1.338]	-2.406 [-6.499,1.686]
TREATMENT	0.862 [-3.508,5.232]	0.186 [-0.411,0.783]	0.102 [-0.569,0.773]
MUNICIPALITY	-0.000524 [-0.0111,0.0100]	-0.000518 [-0.0111,0.0101]	-0.000629 [-0.0112,0.00995]
AGE	0.0871 [-0.190,0.364]	0.0731 [-0.190,0.336]	0.0730 [-0.192,0.338]
GENDER	-0.190 [-0.660,0.279]	0.0940 [-0.550,0.738]	-0.179 [-0.647,0.288]
UNIVERSITY EDUCATION 1 = YES, 0 = NO	-0.290 [-1.509,0.929]	-0.312 [-1.538,0.913]	-0.156 [-1.446,1.133]
DURACIÓN TOTAL DE LA EXPERIENCIA	-0.0843 [-0.338,0.170]	-0.0895 [-0.344,0.165]	-0.0846 [-0.340,0.170]
AGE	-0.0302 [-0.175,0.114]		
		-0.590 [-1.547,0.368]	
GENDER		[	
GENDER			-0.279 [-1.195,0.637]
	-5.233 [-11.00,0.533]	-4.885 [-10.11,0.337]	

 $p < 0;05, \quad p < 0;01, \quad p < 0;001$ 

Table 3 shows the results of the ordinal multinomial logit on the possibility of having received 0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 requests for an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job. Once more, and in order to avoid overextending the analysis, we focused on quadrant 1, as it shows the way in which, under three specifications, the probabilities of a CV being asked for an interview/phone number/positive affirmation regarding the job are affected, as this is the most common result from those who received some of these answers.

We can observe that, under all specifications, the treatment does not affect the probability of being contacted for a single interview. However, it is shown again that being a woman negatively and significantly affects the contact for a job.

### > CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Considering this, our report addressed the situation in different groups of migrants. For example, migrants who have their identity document and are in a regular situation. In this group, it was possible to conclude based on their experiences, that they do not dimension the RUT as a discriminatory system, neither because of the number nor because it says foreign. In general, they do not perceive differences after obtaining this identity document.

However, this group recognizes that the RUT is a factor that opens many doors on its own, which lead to problems for those who do not have this document. They recognize that this document is determinant for the people's quality of. In addition, despite being a valued document, this group was unaware of the data treatment related to the RUT and how their privacy might be affected by it.

In addition, there is a special situation in which this group finds themselves at their arrival, when they obtain a provisional ID card. According to our findings, this provisional ID tends to be a discriminatory element, which puts migrants in a limbo, where they are allowed to live in the country but not allowed to do almost anything on it. This raises concerns about the need for an institutional change that allows new coming migrants to have more opportunities to achieve a good quality of life and a sense of belonging to Chile.

To conclude, it is important to mention that the uncertainty about when the definitive RUT is going to arrive generates discomfort and anxiety. This is exacerbated when the reasons for rejecting a petition are not delivered. Therefore, one of the recommendations of this research is that it's crucial for the migration process to be faster and specially more transparent, with clear

and adequate information about the procedures, the expected times, and the reasoning behind the decisions regarding the ID documents. This cannot only depend on technological processes such as the digital transformation, as this discrimination directly influences the quality of life of people who are already in a situation of vulnerability, and therefore must be approached from a human rights perspective.

In the case of the group corresponding to irregular migrants, who do not have an identity document and a RUT number, they are exposed and vulnerable in the exercise of their rights as migrants and as human beings. This it can be dangerous in many ways, from violence, overcrowding, to physical and mental illness, because for the Chilean public institutions they are almost invisible.

For this reason, it is necessary that the institutions that influence the regularization processes of these irregular migrants to provide a more efficient, but also more flexible and empathic process. There must be less prejudiced towards people in this situation of irregularity, understanding that situations they have been through, and that in most cases their irregularity is not an election but a consequence of other circumstances.

Is also necessary to establish the urgency of better immigration procedures within the country. As these procedures become faster and expeditious, people who have spent much time in certain stages of the regularization process could be ready in terms of regularity in shorter amount of time, streamlining the regularization of the current influx of migrants in our country. This is crucial to unblock the current migratory crisis in the northern frontier of Chile.

Based on the experience of the group of recruiters and employers, we can conclude that indeed there is a discrimination when looking at the migrant as a possible worker. This, because as they do not have their definitive documentation, different difficulties can potentially arise for both the employer and the employee. For example, migrants would not be able to access to certain benefits or would only be if they have their definitive documentation.

As our interviewees were part of companies that employ a workforce with medium training, it would be important and interesting to contrast the situation in companies that employ a less trained workforce.

Notwithstanding the foregoing, the information compiled is encouraging as the social discourse currently promotes inclusion as a valuable contribution to the companies. Multinational companies are at the forefront in showing how to make people of other nationalities without inconvenience in the hosting country.

What is evident is that the current processes of regularization of migrants do not necessarily help them as workers to be easily incorporated into the dynamics of companies. Greater efficiency in the processes is urgently needed, which goes hand in hand with a transparent and clear policy, which ensures that these procedures can be carried out in a dignified and rapid manner.

Finally, based on the experiment we carried out, it's not possible to affirm that there is a statistically significant effect of having a migrant RUT in order to be contacted from a job offer. In other words, at least from the current exercise, it is not possible to affirm that there is a

discrimination, neither positive nor negative, that arises particularly from the RUN of a migrant person.

However, the experiment made it possible to demonstrate and expose an unfortunate reality in Chile, which is that women receive fewer responses than men. Although it is possible to attribute it to direct gender discrimination, this could eventually be also explained by job offers that are indirectly oriented towards men. However, the offers to which the CVs were applied to did not present an obvious or explicit call for men to apply, which is an alarming situation.

## > REFERENCES

- Access Now (2021) "Busting the Dangerous Myths of Big ID Programs: Cautionary Lessons from India" (Available in: https://www.accessnow.org/cms/assets/uploads/2021/10/BigID-Mythbuster.pdf [Accessed on 20 November 2021]).
- Belmar, A. & Pérez, M. (1991) "Chile: Sistemas de Registro Civil y Estadísticas Vitales". In: Latin American Workshop on Strategies for Accelerating the Improvement of Civil Registration and Vital Statistics Systems, Department of Technical Cooperation for Development, United Nations Statistical Office., 6-9 December 1991, pp.82-103. (Available at: https://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/meetings/wshops/1991\_Argentina\_CRVS/Docs/Chile.pdf). [Accessed on 6 January 2022].
- 3. Center for Human Rights and Global Justice, Initiative for Social and Economic Rights, y Unwanted Witness (2021). "Chased away and left to die. How a national security approach to Uganda's national ID has led to wholesale exclusion of women and older persons." Center for Human Rights and Global Justice/ Initiative for Social and Economic Rights/Unwanted Witness: Kampala /Nueva York. (Available at: https://chrgj.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/07/CHRGJ-Report-Chased-Away-and-Left-to-Die.pdf [Accessed on 12 January,2022]).
- Council for Transparency (2011): Data protection. Available at: https://www.consejotransparencia.cl/wp-content/uploads/estudios/2018/01/proteccion\_de\_datos\_web.pdf. [Accessed on 6 January 2021].
- Cullen, Daniel (2020) "High Court of Kenya suspends implementation of biometric ID system", Oxford Human Rights Hub, March 16, 2020. (Disponible en: https://ohrh.law.ox.ac.uk/high-court-of-kenya-suspends-implementation-of-biometric-id-system/ [Accessed on 12 January,2022]).
- Fundación Datos Protegidos and Infomigra (2020) "I am migrant, and my information is your hands". (Available in: https://datosprotegidos.org/descarga-soy-migrant-y-mi-informacion-esta-en-tus-manos/ [Accessed on 6 January 2022].
- Hersey, F. (2021) "Millions excluded as Uganda use national digital ID system for emergency COVID welfare", Biometrics Updated, 16 July 2021. (Available: https://www.biometricupdate.com/202107/millions-excluded-as-uganda-uses-national-digital-id-system-fo r-emergency-covid-welfare [Accessed on 12 January, 2022].
- Kenya News (2021) 'Gov't to Rollout Huduma Namba Phase II Registration', Kenya News, 18 August 2021. (Available at: https://www.kenyanews.go.ke/govt-to-rollout-huduma-namba-phase-ii-registration/ [Accessed on 12 January 2022]).

- 9. Kimuyu, H. (2021) "Huduma Namba cards to replace ID cards by end of 2021", Nairobi News, 18 November 2020. (Available at: https://nairobinews.nation.co.ke/huduma-namba-cards-to-replace-id-cards-by-end-of-2021/ [ Accessed on 12 January,2022]).
- Muya, C. (2021) "What Kenya needs to do to get it right on Huduma Namba", The Star, 24 October 2021. (Available at https://www.the-star.co.ke/siasa/2021-10-24-what-kenya-needs-to-do-to-get-it-right-on-huduma-namb a// [Accessed on January 11,2022]).
- 11. Panigrahi, S. (2021) "Marginalized Aadhaar: How the World's Largest Digital Identification Programme Led to the Exclusion of Marginalized Communities", Yoti Social Purpose 2021, (Available at: https://ssrn.com/abstract=3971724 [Accessed on January 11,2022]).
- 12. Prieto, E. (1923) "The identification of people", Santiago, Chile.
- Privacy International (2021) "When ID leaves you without identity: the case of double registration in Kenya". (Available at: https://privacyinternational.org/video/4412/when-id-leaves-you-without-identity-case-double-registratio n-kenya [Accessed January 12, 2022]).
- Rao, S. (2021) "Bengaluru: Why Hospitals Insist on Aadhaar to Register Citizens for Vaccination. "The Times of India, April 4 2021 (Available at: https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/city/bengaluru/why-hospitals-insist-on-aadhaar-to-register-citizens-f or-vaccination/articleshow/81895866.cms [Accessed on January 11, 2022]).
- Ravichandra, N. (2021) "Aadhaar and Exclusion: The Public Distribution System in Inida", [blog] Nalsar University of Law. (Available at: https://library.nalsar.ac.in/2021/12/19/aadhaar-and-exclusion-the-public-distribution-system-in-india/ [Accessed on 28 December 2021]).
- Roshni, A. (2018) "Identity in exile", The Indian Express, May 18, 2018. (Available at: https://indianexpress.com/article/opinion/columns/supreme-court-rohingya-refugees-aadhaar-card-act -uidai-5180821/ [Accessed on 11 January 2022]).
- Sahay, S. (2019) "Death by digital exclusion? on faulty public distribution system in Jharkhand", The Hindu, July 13, 2019 (Available at: https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/other-states/death-by-digital-exclusion/article28414768.ece [Accessed on 11 January 2022]).
- Singh N. & Krishna, S. (2018) "Response to Call for Submissions on Digital Technology, Social Protection and Human Rights", Submission to the Special Rapporteur on extreme poverty and human rights, Philip Alston, Centre for Communication Governance at the National Law University Delhi. (Available at: https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Poverty/DigitalTechnology/NationalLawUniversityDelhi.pdf) [Accessed onNovember 20, 2021]).
- Taylor, L. (2021) "Millions of Ugandas denied vital services over digital ID cards", Reuters, June 8 2021. (Available at: https://www.reuters.com/article/us-uganda-tech-rights-idUSKCN2DK28W [Accessed on 20 November 2021]).

- 20. UN General Assembly [UNGA] (2019), "Report of the Special Rapporteur on extreme poverty and human rights" 11 October 2019. (Available at https://undocs.org/en/A/74/493 [Accessed on 12 January 2022]).
- 21. UN Human Rights Council [HRC] (2020). "Racial discrimination and emerging digital technologies: a human rights analysis: report of the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance", 18 June 2020, A/HRC/44/57. (Available at https://undocs.org/es/A/HRC/44/57 [Accessed on 12 January,2022]).
- Unwanted Witness (2021). "Preliminary Report Uganda's Digital ID System: A cocktail of Discrimination" (Available at: https://www.unwantedwitness.org/download/uploads/UgandaE28099s-Digital-ID-System.pdf [Accessed on 20 November 2021]).
- 23. Weitzberg, K. (2020) "In Kenya, thousands left in limbo without ID cards: A government program for citizens and refugees highlights the pitfalls of humanitarian biometrics". Coda, 13 April 2020. (Available at https://www.codastory.com/authoritarian-tech/kenya-biometrics-double-registration/ [Accessed on 12 January 2022]).